

Comments

1

Responses

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PUBLIC COMMENT MEETING
MARINE RESOURCE STUDY -
ARCHAEOLOGICAL SUBSURFACE SURVEY - DEIS
FEBRUARY 24, 2007
WAIANAЕ, WAIANAЕ DISTRICT PARK

BEFORE: RITA KING, RPR, CSR #373
Court Reporter, State of Hawaii

Comments

Responses

2

| | | |
|----|-----------------------------|------|
| 1 | I N D E X | |
| 2 | | |
| 3 | FACILITATOR: Annelle Amaral | |
| 4 | | |
| 5 | SPEAKERS: | Page |
| 6 | Shermaih K. Iaea, Jr. | 3 |
| 7 | Bill Prescott | 8 |
| 8 | Adrian Silva, Jr. | 12 |
| 9 | Pat Patterson | 13 |
| 10 | David Henkin | 15 |
| 11 | William Aila | 22 |
| 12 | Albert Silva | 35 |
| 13 | Vince Dodge | 38 |
| 14 | Jonathan Deenik | 44 |
| 15 | David Henkin | 47 |
| 16 | Fred Dodge | 66 |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |

Comments

3

1 SHERMAIH IAEEA, JR.: Aloha kakou. If I
2 knew that I was going to be invited up here to
3 speak when I signed in, I would have my wife sign
4 in because I'm not an eloquent speaker, but I'm
5 here, basically, because during the last meeting
6 they asked for verification of the lineage that we
7 have, family lineage in Makua, and we do have
8 family lineage, very big family lineage in Makua.
9 I have a paper here from Dr. Reverand Kaleo
10 Patterson who wrote this for me, and he says that
11 he's the grandson, he's the great, great, great
12 grandson of Kamakea, which is part of our lineage,
13 and I am the great, great grandson of Kamakea and
14 Issac Iaea.

15 This is a very brief description of
16 family relationship in Makua Valley and surrounding
17 area that is documented to Mahele records. In the
18 Mahele Claims for Kawailoa, you will find Kamakea
19 LCA2896, Iaea LCA3454-B, and Moo LCA3703, these
20 names are all related to ohana, and these are the
21 names you find related to LCA6092 in Makua Valley,
22 Kahanahaiki, two parcels under Kamakea and the
23 Iaea. Other names are also related as you will
24 find listed in Kawailoa Mahele. Oral history
25 consists of fishing and seasonal camping, family

Responses

Comments

4

1 burial areas in the area and connection with
2 Waialua and Kawailoa. For more information on
3 genealogy on Kamakea, Iaea and Moo, and others, see
4 Anahulu Volumes I and II by Patrick V. Kirch and
5 Marshall Sahlins.

6 Many Iaea-Kamakea family members still
7 live in Makaha and on the Waianae Coast. Very
8 little knowledge of Makua since displacement most
9 family connection related to Kawailoa/Waialua,
10 written by Kaleo Patterson. This is the
11 documentation of the families, all families on
12 Makua. So, I'm through with that. That was what I
13 was told to bring, but I have other things to say.

14 I'm a very angry military guy. I spent a
15 good part of my life in the military, and when I
16 find that Hawaiians are up in arms and trying to
17 protest what we are trying to do right by
18 protesting our training, by saying we can't do this
19 and we can't do that, it just hurts me.

20 I really don't know what you're
21 protesting about our training in little Makua,
22 about the fish, about the bones, you know, our land
23 is sacred, all land is sacred, where I live, where
24 you live now, not just Makua. What are you
25 protesting? You protesting against our gods or

Responses

Comments

Responses

5

1 your god? You protesting the violence? What are
2 you protesting, the animals, the plants? There are
3 plants up there, there's plenty goats up there,
4 too, eating the plants, why don't you protest them?
5 It doesn't make any sense, it doesn't make any
6 sense one bit. There's a law that should be
7 passed, and I wish we had martial law because we
8 are at war, whether you like it or not.

9 I remember during the Second World War, I
10 was 10 years old at the time, I lived in Kalihi at
11 that time, right up the road about two blocks away
12 they had an Army camp, I used to go with the guys
13 up there and go to the mess hall and eat with them,
14 so I've been a military guy for a long time. When
15 they were here at that time they can do anything
16 they wanted because there was a war going on.
17 Well, what the hell, the war's going on now. What
18 can we do now? We run into protest after protest.
19 I don't understand that, I don't understand
20 anything about the limu, the fish, the water or the
21 bones, all I know is all my relatives in heaven,
22 they're not in Makua, all my people are in heaven.
23 So is the land sacred? Yes, all land is sacred.
24 If there was a way that we can, I would award
25 everyone in the protest group, if there's any way

Comments

6

Responses

1 we can do something, to get them for treason,
2 that's what it is, treason. Thank you.

3 ANNELLE AMARAL: Thank you, Mr. Iaea.
4 Mahalo.

5 Our next speaker is Debra Gregory and
6 following Debra is Bill Prescott.

7
8 DEBRA GREGORY: Hi, my name's Debra
9 Gregory. I don't have too much to say right now, I
10 just got the report and I briefly reviewed it, and
11 I'm shocked, my intelligence is so insulted and
12 this is why. You're supposed to do 350, you did
13 350 probes, that's what you call them, probes, 350
14 probes, 50 were done in area one, am I correct, or
15 was that area three? You should know, right?

16 ANNELLE AMARAL: This is the time that
17 you get to make a statement, not ask questions.

18 DEBRA GREGORY: Okay. Well, I got
19 nothing really much to say right now except that
20 I'm really, I'm really flabbergasted, this is so
21 insulting, I can't believe you guys put this in
22 here. I mean, why do a subsurface survey in an
23 area where it's highly unlikely that you will
24 uncover anything archeological, like in a lava
25 field where the rocks are like 20 feet thick, so

Comments

Responses

7

1 thick, in fact, that you had to put -- what is it
2 called -- AraGas. So 200 probes done by gas in an
3 area where it's highly unlikely, and you even said
4 so yourself, highly unlikely that you will find any
5 archeological remains of anything. Okay, so you
6 did 150, you did 150 subsurface probes in areas
7 where you were actually supposed to have done them,
8 that's good, but then the 200 in an area where you
9 weren't supposed to have done them, took it upon
10 yourself to change the plan entirely, so this is
11 totally unacceptable, I won't qualify it, I won't
12 quantify it, and you can kiss my ass.

13 ANNELLE AMARAL: Mahalo.

14 If you haven't had a chance to read the
15 document and you want to read it, then put in your
16 testimony at a later time. As has already been
17 indicated, that can be done by the website.

18 Again, I'm going to repeat, we have some
19 strong feelings one way or the other about the
20 subject matter, and it is wonderful to hear your
21 mana'o, there is no need to be rude, there is no
22 need to be disagreeable, so if we can sort of
23 manage ourselves and temper ourselves, I'd
24 appreciate it. Mahalo.

25 Our next speaker is Mr. Prescott, and

Comments

Responses

8

1 after that Adrian Silva.

2 Aloha, Mr. Prescott.

3

4 BILL PRESCOTT: Aloha kakou, my name is
5 Bill Prescott, I'm Bill Punini Prescott, I want you
6 all to know that I am a native Hawaiian. You know,
7 back in those days, my mother's days, the
8 Hawaiian's tended to marry haoles who had some
9 money, you know, like Bernice Pauahi married
10 Charles Bishop and Lydia Dominis -- how many of you
11 know Lydia Dominis?

12 ANNELLE AMARAL: Liliuokalani.

13 BILL PRESCOTT: Everybody knows her by
14 Liliuokalani. She married a haole. These guys had
15 money, my mother married somebody that was good
16 looking.

17 Anyway, to start with, having read the
18 works that went into the marine resource study and
19 archeological subsurface survey, I want to
20 compliment all of you for doing a job well done.
21 You know, at this time, I'd really like to address
22 members of our community and say on behalf of the
23 Waianae Veterans of Foreign Wars, we want to ask
24 you to join us in supporting the training our
25 soldiers will need in order to accomplish their

Comments

9

1 mission and return home safely after they deploy
2 later this year, keeping in mind that many of these
3 soldiers to be deployed are our own Hawaii sons and
4 daughters. You know, we sometimes tend to forget
5 that our soldiers are stationed in Hawaii not by
6 choice, they're here because those that we elected
7 to congress, Senator Dan Inouye, Akaka,
8 Representatives Abercrombie and Case, brought the
9 people here, and it wasn't our soldier's decision
10 to fight terrorism in Iraq and Afghanistan, they're
11 there because our president and our congressional
12 representatives, who we elected, decided to send
13 them there, it wasn't our soldier's choice. So if
14 you don't agree with the decision that was made,
15 then you should take it up with those people that
16 you elected and not our soldiers.

17 To those Hawaiians who believe that Makua
18 is sacred, we, the native Hawaiians of the Waianae
19 Veterans of Foreign Wars, want to assure you that
20 Makua is no more sacred than the grounds on which
21 this building now sits. Anyone who has studied
22 Hawaiian culture knows that there was a time when
23 mana, or spiritual power, existed in people, in
24 plants, animals, yes, and even stones, and that
25 mana controlled all aspects of Hawaiian life. This

Responses

Comments

Responses

10

1 spiritual power came from the gods and those
2 closest to the gods had the most mana, people had
3 more mana than the plants, than the rocks. The
4 kahunas had more spiritual power than the people,
5 and the Alii, because they could trace their
6 lineage back to the gods, had even more mana,
7 spiritual power.

8 The kapu protected the mana and helped to
9 maintain order. Breaking a kapu could have
10 terrible consequences, the gods could get angry and
11 vengeful causing volcanos to erupt, tidal waves to
12 form, earthquakes to devastate the land, and,
13 therefore, anyone breaking the kapu had to be put
14 to death, and those were our Hawaiian cultural
15 practices in those days. However, in 1819 all of
16 that changed when Liholiho, Kamehameha II, sat and
17 dined with some noble women, including his mother,
18 Queen Keopuolani. By doing so, the King himself
19 openly violated one of the most sacred of all
20 kapus, that which prohibited men and women from
21 eating together.

22 You know, shortly thereafter,
23 Kamehameha II ordered all the god images to be
24 burned, all the heiaus demolished throughout the
25 islands, all of the heiaus, these were sacred

Comments

11

Responses

1 places of worship, some of these heiaus, luakinis,
2 were used to sacrifice Hawaiians to the gods, no
3 more were they sacred, and what his orders did was
4 to bring an end to the Hawaiian religion and the
5 kapu system that supported it. Now, with the
6 arrival of Christians the following year in 1820,
7 Hawaiians were quick to embrace this religion of
8 one god, a god of love and forgiveness. With this
9 god you could break a kapu and sin against this god
10 and still be forgiven. So while Makua was
11 considered sacred in our old culture, it is not now
12 sacred in our new culture. And just as people had
13 more mana than plants and animals back in the old
14 culture, being born in the image and likeness of
15 god, sacredness of people still reign in our new
16 culture.

17 To those who oppose the military, let me
18 ask you, Do you oppose police officers as well, do
19 you believe that we will ever be rid of crime and
20 criminals on our streets, and do you believe we
21 will ever see the end of wars and meaningless mass
22 killing of people? Just as our police keep our
23 families safe from harm, so, too, does our military
24 keep our country safe from radical nations and
25 terrorists who wish to do us harm.

Comments

12

1 You know, one last thought I'd like to
2 leave you with is what Prime Minister Tony Blair
3 said when asked why he believed in America so much,
4 and what he said was, You know what, a simple way
5 to measure the worth of a country is to look at how
6 many people want in and how many people want out.
7 He went on to say, there are only two defining
8 forces ever offered to die for you, one was Jesus
9 Christ, the other the American GI, one died for
10 your soul and the other for your freedom.

11 Again, I ask you to join us in supporting
12 our soldier's training needs. Thank you.

13 ANNELE AMARAL: Thank you very much.

14 Our next speaker is Adrian Silva, Junior,
15 followed by Pat Patterson.

16 Adrian Silva, Junior.

17

18 ADRIAN SILVA, JUNIOR: Aloha. You know,
19 it's very obvious that everybody sitting in the
20 chairs in front of me must have a child somewhere
21 or know of a child. What I'm talking about is the
22 word training. We know this EIS is very important,
23 likewise with training. How many of you have kids
24 in high school, kids in elementary school, they're
25 training; isn't that correct? Without training we

Responses

Comments

Responses

13

1 would be useless, we wouldn't be able to read, we
2 wouldn't be able to write, that's training.

3 You know, most of you understand the role
4 in the life of a soldier, he goes far off and he
5 trains, and he tells you it's frightening, you
6 never know when and which bullet has your name on
7 it, but he has got to be on his very best and
8 that's why he trains. So I don't want to be up
9 here too long to let you know that if a GI don't
10 train, he's not ready. EIS is important and so is
11 a soldier's life. Thank you.

12 ANNELLE AMARAL: Thank you, very much.

13 Our next speaker is Pat Patterson,
14 followed by David Henkin.

15

16 PAT PATTERSON: Aloha, I'm Pat Patterson,
17 a member of the Hui Malama O Makua, the larger
18 group that has their arms around Malama Makua. I
19 haven't been to the library to pick up my copies of
20 these reports but I'm very happy to see them.

21 Opening up the one on the archeological
22 study, something came to me that's bothered me ever
23 since I've been involved with Makua since 1996.

24 All of the areas of Makua have the names of animals
25 we don't even have in Hawaii, to me that tells me

Comments

Responses

14

1 people who use those names don't belong there,
2 Badger, Fox, Dear, Deeds, Coyote, Wolf, at least we
3 could have Hawaiian animals, and we might get used
4 to calling them that.

5 I looked at the foldout map on the
6 archeology, also Figures 15, 16 and 17, it shows
7 the shovel test probes, but it doesn't say how deep
8 those went, whether it was one shovel full or 10
9 shovels full. You know, archeological tells all
10 across the world there are layers indicating
11 whether there were people living there or not, and
12 then they get covered up and covered up and covered
13 up, I don't think shovel probes would tell very
14 much about an area where people have lived for,
15 perhaps, 2,000 years, I know we've got to go much,
16 much deeper.

17 On page 10 I see two unrecorded
18 archeological features, my question is, When will
19 those unrecorded archeological features been
20 investigated and studied? And this brings me to
21 asking another question to Dr. Lucking, Have you
22 yet had a chance to look at the archeological sites
23 on the north road and above?

24 As far as the marine resources study, I'm
25 very happy that this has occurred. Before, when we

T65-1

If a feature was located, it would have been preserved. The Army's position has been to preserve the sites, not to destroy them by digging them up.

T65-1

Comments

Responses

15

1 only went around the edge of the muluwai and go
2 down seven inches, we didn't learn very much.
3 Hopefully, this study will give us a great deal
4 more. Thank you.

5 ANNELLE AMARAL: Thank you very much.
6 Our next speaker is Mr. David Henkin.
7 David Henkin.

8

9 DAVID HENKIN: Aloha kakou, my name is
10 David Henkin, I'm an attorney with Earth Justice,
11 and since 1995 I've been working with members of
12 this community over concerns about the effects of
13 live fire training at Makua.

14 I'd like to sort of preface this by
15 explaining what exactly I've been doing over the
16 last 12 years. This really isn't a question about
17 whether American soldiers are going to be able to
18 train, it's a question about making informed
19 decisions about the best places to do that. The
20 purpose of the Environmental Impact Study and of
21 the National Environmental Policy Act is to make
22 sure that the Army and, in fact, every federal
23 agency can make fully informed decisions about
24 where to carry out its activities, particularly
25 where those activities might cause significant

Comments

Responses

16

1 effects to the human environment, so we're in that
2 equation.

3 So, you know, ultimately it's not about
4 whether soldiers train or not, it's about where
5 they should train and how they should train, an
6 informed decision, and that's an informed decision
7 not only that the Army needs to make but the law
8 recognizes the importance of public information so
9 that the public can keep an eye on its government,
10 its elected officials, the folks who said that we
11 need to hold them accountable for the decisions,
12 absolutely correct. Part of this environmental
13 review process is to make sure that we have the
14 information that we need to so that we can know
15 what should be done and if we disagree with the
16 decisions that are made by the Army, we can raise
17 that through the Democrat process.

18 It's in that spirit that I offer these
19 comments. First, a few I just want to get out of
20 the way, a few procedural things, they're not
21 really procedural, but they're not getting to the
22 substance. In order to provide the public with an
23 opportunity, really, to offer meaningful comments
24 here, and by the public I mean lay people like
25 myself and also experts who can really take a look

Comments

Responses

17

1 at these marine studies and get into the science of
2 it, they need to have the data on which those
3 studies are based, and I know that there was an
4 effort to put those on the website. I did mention
5 to the Tetra Tech folks, and I just want to put it
6 on the record, that the field notes for the marine
7 study are in many cases completely illegible, not
8 suggesting anyone did anything intentional but you
9 need to make the copies darker so one can actually
10 read what species was collected where, and that
11 information should be promptly provided to the
12 public because we have a limited amount of time to
13 comment. We have retained Ph.D.'s in this and
14 they've just said they cannot review certain
15 aspects of the study until they actually can look
16 at the data.

17 Same thing, there's a table B, as in boy,
18 one that was supposed to be in appendix B that
19 would set forth how the samples were composited, in
20 other words, how different fish and limu species
21 were mixed together. I couldn't find it, I looked
22 through every page of appendix B, hundreds of
23 pages, I couldn't find it, so, again, that
24 information just needs to be provided. And, again,
25 these are things that just unintentional, I'm sure,

Comments

Responses

18

1 but even the hard copies that were provided today
2 of the document, and it's appreciated the effort,
3 if you look at it, and I don't know what's going on
4 with the word processing program, but look, for
5 example, on page 4-6, there are boxes instead of
6 numbers, so certain numbers are coming through as
7 boxes. So, you know, for example, if you want to,
8 you know, they say later, USEPA guidance provides a
9 mean uncooked fish consumption rate for the general
10 U.S. population of box, 2.59 grams per day, and,
11 anyway, there's boxes all over the place, so you
12 actually don't even have the numbers, so we need to
13 correct that, and I think we need to extend the
14 comment period, there's a 60 day comment period as
15 required under the settlement agreement so that
16 people can actually review the information. That
17 information, you know, should be provided promptly,
18 both on the website and in a hard copy to people
19 who wanted it.

20 Getting to the substance of the EIS,
21 because this is a comment period as well on the
22 entire Environmental Impact Statement, the draft
23 that was put out for review last year, I think it
24 was last year, it's been awhile, one of the
25 questions that came up had to do with the alleged

Comments

19

1 necessity of Makua, and one of the concerns that we
 2 raised in the earlier round of comments on the
 3 draft EIS is what are the alternatives to training
 4 at Makua, where are the other places that the Army
 5 can train the soldiers to perform the tasks that
 6 they're called upon to perform?

7 In the original, and I say original draft
 8 because I hope that there's going to be a revised
 9 draft put out for comment, in the original draft
 10 the only location that was looked at for training
 11 of soldiers was Makua, and we were told there was
 12 going to be, alternative one was training at Makua,
 13 alternative two was more training at Makua and
 14 alternative three was yet more training at Makua,
 15 and we said there's got to be other places where
 16 you can do this training, where you can provide
 17 these opportunities. Fortunately, congress agreed
 18 with us, and my understanding is that the Army is
 19 under congressional directive to provide a report
 20 by March 1st, that's next week, of alternate
 21 locations where they can conduct the training that
 22 is currently proposed for Makua. I assume that the
 23 Army is complying with congress's demand, that
 24 there are alternatives being proposed, and those
 25 alternatives, as well as any other alternatives the

T65-2

Responses

T65-2

A summary of report prepared pursuant to the Fiscal Year 2007 National Defense Authorization Action has been added to Section 2.2 of the EIS.

The EIS considered other alternatives in Section 2.5. The EIS now includes evaluation of an alternative in which training proposed for MMR would be conducted at the Pohakuloa Training Area, island of Hawaii (See Chapter 2 for a description of this alternative). This alternative was added in response to public comments received on the Draft EIS. Use of MMR, however, remains the preferred alternative.

Comments

Responses

20

T65-2

1 public mentioned during the comment period need to
2 be analyzed in the Environmental Impact Statement.
3 When you have new alternatives,
4 substantially new alternatives, because any new
5 location would be, by definition, a substantially
6 new alternative, in EIS, you need to put that back
7 out for public comment because there may be effects
8 associated with the alternate locations that the
9 public needs to be able to review and comment on.
10 It may ultimately be that Makua is the best place
11 for this training, that's not something that I
12 personally believe but this is not a process about
13 my personal beliefs, this is a process about
14 getting the information out so that people can
15 arrive at their own decisions and the Army can make
16 an informed decision. So if there are alternate
17 locations where you're considering to do the
18 training, whether it's at Schofield, whether it's
19 elsewhere, whether it's on redesigned training
20 ranges, all of those need to be put out for public
21 comment in a revised draft EIS, and all of us, I
22 think, would like to see this process come to a
23 close where we get the information that we need to
24 make a decision, so I would encourage the Army to
25 do that sooner rather than later, but that needs to

Comments

Responses

21

1 be done. By definition, any alternative that's
 2 identified in the report that comes out next week
 3 is a reasonable alternative that the Army is under
 4 a legal obligation to analyze.

5 Now, Annelle, I'm just going to ask you
 6 because I have a lot of thoughts about this but I
 7 don't want to cut off other speakers, so I can come
 8 back. What would be best?

9 ANNELLE AMARAL: I have two speakers
 10 signed up, the intention was to take a break and
 11 allow more people to sign up.

12 DAVID HENKIN: How about this, I think to
 13 that one thought about the need to study other
 14 alternative locations, the existence of other
 15 locations, we submitted testimony the last time
 16 around that, even if the other location is not
 17 currently available, because you need to build a
 18 new range or move things around, that the Army
 19 needs to look at alternatives that involve
 20 temporary, short-term use of Makua before the
 21 alternate range is available, those would clearly
 22 cause less environmental impact, less cultural
 23 impact on the resources at Makua than long-term
 24 permanent training there, so those are reasonable
 25 alternatives that need to be looked at. I'll get

T65-3

T65-3

Section 2.5 of the EIS has been revised to address construction of replacement training facilities.

Comments

Responses

22

1 into some issues related to the marine study and
 2 the archeological study, but for now I want to let
 3 other people talk, so, mahalo.

4 ANNELLE AMARAL: Mahalo.

5 As I had indicated, what I'm going to do
 6 is I'm going to call on the next speaker, the next
 7 speaker is William Aila, to make his comments on
 8 the record, and then what I'd like to do is to give
 9 you a bit of a break, those of you that have not
 10 yet had an opportunity to sign up to speak, I'll
 11 give you the opportunity to do that then, and then
 12 we'll do the second round to allow you to make your
 13 comments on the record.

14 So, William, William Aila.

15

16 WILLIAM AILA: Mahalo.

17 Aloha kakou everybody, my name is William
 18 Aila, for the record, Johnson middle name, Junior
 19 last name, or suffix. Comments are going to be
 20 short and choppy.

21 Colonel Killian, very similar to the
 22 question that David asked, will the results of the
 23 study requested by Representative Abercrombie
 24 studying alternate training areas to replace Makua
 25 be included in the analysis in the draft EIS for

T66-1

T66-1

The EIS considered other alternatives in Section 2.5. The EIS now includes evaluation of an alternative in which training proposed for MMR would be conducted at the Pohakuloa Training Area, island of Hawaii (See Chapter 2 for a description of this alternative). This alternative was added in response to public comments received on the Draft EIS. Use of MMR, however, remains the preferred alternative.

Comments

Responses

23

T66-1 | 1 Makua? I think that's a reasonable thing to do, I
 2 think it would also provide you with reasonable
 3 alternatives. How much money has been spent to
 4 date for the last 10 years in maintaining and
 T66-2 | 5 operating Makua military reservation, how much
 6 money is budgeted for the next five years for the
 7 operations of Makua military reservation, I think
 8 those are all good numbers that should be in there,
 9 also. Will the draft EIS analyze and explain how
 10 the Army units for the last, oh, I would say last
 11 six years the marine units and the National Guard
 12 units how they've been certified as trained even
 13 though they haven't been trained in Makua, there
 14 needs to be an analysis of that because if history
 15 can demonstrate that the Army has the ability, that
 T66-3 | 16 the Marines have the ability, that the National
 17 Guard has the ability to be certified as fit for
 18 fighting wars, as the recent history for the last
 19 six years has clearly demonstrated, clearly,
 20 clearly, clearly demonstrated, Makua has not been
 21 used, and they have fought, that needs to be
 22 analyzed, and it needs to be placed in the draft
 23 EIS. If you can find another alternative, as you
 24 have, and they've fought very, very well, then that
 25 needs to be placed in the EIS as part of the

T66-2
 The alternatives considered in the Draft EIS, both those evaluated in detail and those eliminated from further analysis, were analyzed based on their ability to satisfy the purpose and need, not on whether they are cost prohibitive.

T66-3
 While units have been assessed in the past as ready for combat without conducting live-fire training exercises at MMR, the lack of live-fire training at MMR reduces a unit's readiness level and increases the potential for casualties, as the Army is forced to undertake work-arounds. The lack of a home-based live-fire training range also has an impact on Soldier morale because more time is spent away from family, which in turn affects performance and readiness.

Comments

Responses

24

T66-3 |

1 summary.

2 Regarding the use of the proposed ranges
 3 in conjunction with the stryker brigade at
 4 Schofield and at Pohakuloa, my understanding from
 5 talking to, oh, he's not here today, Ron Borne, is
 6 that the design of those ranges are capable of
 7 being used for company combined assault training
 8 qualifications and, as such, are a reasonable
 9 alternative to be studied to Makua, so making sure
 10 that that alternative analysis is included in the
 11 draft EIS.

T66-4

12 Regarding the marine study, sample size
 13 is too small. The Nanakuli Muluwai, I think we
 14 told you ahead of time that that was not a good
 15 choice to use because of the past military uses in
 16 Nanakuli, so it's not like you weren't told ahead
 17 of time don't use it, and you still went ahead and
 18 used it, so the results are mixed, the results are
 19 unsubstantiated, the results have failed to comply
 20 with our request for reasonable study. We told you
 21 not to do it and you did it, we told you why, too,
 22 and you did it anyway. There's a clear pattern
 23 going on here, very clear pattern.

24 A more reasonable alternative would be to
 25 look at the baseline of a pristine muluwai, that

T66-4

Section 2.5 of the EIS has been revised to address construction of replacement training facilities.

Comments

Responses

25

1 baseline is closer to Makua 70 years ago than
2 Nanakuli is, you're comparing apples with oranges.
3 The baseline that we need to be looking at is the
4 baseline that occurred before the military showed
5 up and started bombing and started burning and
6 started dumping and started doing OBOD disposal
7 there, that's the baseline, not the baseline for
8 the last 20 years, the baseline is what occurred
9 before the military showed up and evicted people
10 from Makua Valley, that's the baseline. That
11 should always be the baseline, whether it's
12 archeological, whether it's chemical, whether it's
13 hydrological, whether it's sociological.
14 The marine study clearly states in
15 several places in the executive summary about
16 uncertainties, uncertainties of baselines by which
17 to make comparisons, uncertainties of order of
18 magnitude of effect, uncertainties based on
19 assumptions which translate into risk assessment,
20 and what we asked for was some certainty, not more
21 uncertainty when we requested the muluwai study, we
22 want to know with certainty, is the fish safe to
23 eat, are the crabs safe to eat, is the limu safe to
24 eat? That's all we asked for. We get a report
25 with all of these assumptions that based on further

Comments

Responses

26

1 assumptions which result in greater uncertainty.
2 You haven't answered the question, you
3 haven't answered the question, you've raised more
4 questions, like now, Is the arsenic organic or
5 inorganic? Gee, I don't know, maybe I should stop
6 eating the limu but until you guys tell me, because
7 if it's inorganic, then chances are I'm going to
8 die of cancer. You guys knew when you were doing
9 the study that there are two forms of arsenic, why
10 didn't you just figure out what the percentage was
11 in the limu and the fish instead of coming back
12 with our report that's full of uncertainty.
13 The choice of Sandy Beach as an alternate
14 control site, wow, who came up with that one? They
15 should have gone back and checked the records.
16 Alan Davis was used to house military folks, there
17 were military activities that occurred at Alan
18 Davis, Alan Davis is another name for Sandy Beach.
19 So you compare an area that has been used
20 for military activities with an area that is being
21 used for military activities and, guess what, the
22 difference shouldn't be that much, so does that
23 make it okay? More appropriate, and we said this
24 in our comments to you before you designed the
25 study, we said, use someplace where there's been no

Comments**Responses**

27

1 military influence, use Haena on Kauai, use
2 someplace on the North Shore of Molokai, that's the
3 baseline, that's the appropriate baseline in which
4 to make comparisons because you guys not going to
5 eat the fish, you guys going to serve two years
6 over here and you guys going to leave, but we got
7 to eat the fish and we got to eat the limu.

8 So, inappropriate use of alternate sites
9 controls, a report that's filled with uncertainty,
10 making me even more uncertain now, it didn't answer
11 my questions, and I thought our questions was
12 pretty simple, and I thought when we asked our
13 comments on the study we were pretty clear, Use
14 appropriate baselines, you didn't. The study fails
15 to address our concerns, the study should not be
16 included in the DEIS, and you should answer the
17 other questions that have been raised, otherwise
18 your EIS is incomplete, and we all know what
19 happens in front of judges when EIS's are
20 incomplete. Don't go there, don't do it, just do
21 us right by the people of Waianae, answer the
22 questions, that's all we want to know.

23 And the final comment is there's so much
24 uncertainty that has been raised by the muluwai
25 study right now that there is a huge demand for

Comments

Responses

28

1 quantifying some of the questions that it came out.
2 For example, the arsenic, for example, where did
3 those chemicals that are associated with
4 Heptachlore and pesticide use, agriculture
5 pesticide use end up in fish in Makua. Now,
6 knowing what I know now, that in the 1940s, the
7 1950s, the 1960s and 1970s, that anybody with
8 access to the key, anybody could have gone to
9 Schofield, obtained the key, gone up to Makua and
10 done open burn and open destination dumping of
11 whatever, we don't know what's there, just like we
12 didn't know there was depleted uranium at
13 Schofield. You know, we don't know until we know,
14 so what's wrong with us asking the questions. If
15 it's treasonous to ask questions, I'm guilty, I'll
16 tell you right now, I'm proud to be guilty because
17 I can look my grandkids in the eyes and I can tell
18 them I tried.
19 So, let's do the task at hand, let's look
20 at reasonable alternatives to training at Makua,
21 let's look at the impact of 60 plus years of
22 military use in Makua with questionable
23 recordkeeping, very questionable recordkeeping,
24 very questionable disposal techniques in those open
25 burn and open destination pits, just bring the

Comments**Responses**

29

1 stuff over here, it's too old, no more than 10
2 percent never go off, so pile them up, bring them
3 over here. You know what, we get some contaminated
4 jet fuel, we get some contaminated diesel we got to
5 get rid of, dig the hole, throw them inside, set
6 them on fire. Oh, by the way, we never keep all
7 the records. So we really don't know what's up
8 there, we don't really know what the source is of
9 those Heptachlore related compounds that's found in
10 the fish at Makua, something that I wouldn't
11 consider, but now I consider and I put two plus two
12 together, Oh, no record keeping, they could have
13 put anything in those pits for all those years,
14 maybe some guy in the pineapple company wanted to
15 get rid of some Heptachlore, he says, Hey, brah,
16 you guys get access to Makua, how about you take my
17 truck up there and you pour them in those pits and
18 dispose of them for us, no record keeping, no
19 record keeping of depleted uranium at Schofield.
20 Very scary. You try to get me to feel
21 comfortable, you try to build trust and then we
22 find these things. Initially, no report on any
23 kind of chemicals disposed of in Makua, then we
24 find this U.H. report, then we follow the
25 bibliography, and then we find all kinds of other

Comments

Responses

30

1 things. Like I said, we had to find that stuff,
2 nobody when I first approached the staff at Makua
3 was willing to tell me. Oh, and by the way, we
4 found some more evidence in some reports of a
5 crater bomb dump. Gee, nobody told us, they knew
6 it was there, we asked to do sampling around there,
7 all of a sudden we find, oh, magical, the stuff get
8 cleaned up, all hauled out, the cars that was in
9 there, the wires that was in there all disappeared,
10 no analysis. You like us trust you, you're asking
11 me to trust him?

12 A VOICE: Sure, why not?

13 WILLIAM AILA: I don't think I can, based
14 upon everything that I've been exposed to. You can
15 trust me because I tell the truth, I tell the
16 truth. I went over the treason part. I'm glad
17 we're having this discussion because I want to give
18 you a little Hawaiian, since you gave some Hawaiian
19 culture, I want to give you just a little bit more.

20 Our Kapuna, our Kapuna wasn't cannibal
21 savages and all-around bad guys, that if you broke
22 a kapu you were destined to die, come on, we had
23 compassionate Kapuna, we come from them. Brother
24 no mention about Puulalula, you can go up there and
25 be absolved. Brother no mentioned that chiefs had

Comments

Responses

31

1 the ability to pardon people, so I just want to
2 provide some additional Hawaiian culture to some
3 people who I don't want to misconstrue the chiefs
4 and the kapu system was all bad. You know what, we
5 don't have no kapu system today, guess what, we
6 have no more fish, we have no more limu, all that
7 stuff went. If the kapu system was around today, I
8 don't think we would get drug use.

9 The other reason why alternatives to
10 Makua have to be completely analyzed is because a
11 promise was made, you can no make believe was
12 there, it's in the lease, you can go back and look,
13 it's in the palapala, the promise was made six
14 months after World War II, Makua is to be returned,
15 not just to the families that live there, because
16 the majority, the vast majority of the land at
17 Makua which was illegally taken under the guise of
18 an illegal martial law declaration, you can go to
19 the Supreme Court and find out that later on
20 martial law in Hawaii was declared to be
21 unconstitutional, go do a little bit more research.
22 That promise that was made has not been kept to
23 today. The majority of the lands in Makua Valley
24 are crown lands which became illegal ceded lands to
25 the United States of America, which they were

Comments

Responses

32

1 illegally ceded back to the State of Hawaii, which
2 are illegally leased to the U.S. Army, so maybe I
3 not such treasonous after all, maybe I just
4 honoring the right government. Thank you.

5 I have two things that I would like you
6 to translate for the record. One is part of a
7 chant, okay.

8 E iho ana o luna

9 E pii ana o lalo

10 E hui ana na moku

11 E ku ana ka paia

12 That's my hookupu to all the veterans in
13 the audience, and the guys that know their culture,
14 hoi no ai i kou kahu. Thank you.

15 ANNELLE AMARAL: What I'm going to do
16 here for a moment is I only have one person
17 registered to speak, and he wanted to be the last
18 speaker, so I'm going to give you all an
19 opportunity, those of you that came late, to go and
20 sign up so that you have an opportunity to get onto
21 the record or go and get something to eat and
22 drink, which you can also do, and we'll come back
23 in five minutes, and we'll take whoever else has
24 signed up to speak, and then we'll be pau.

25 (The proceedings were at recess.)

Comments

Responses

33

1 ANNELE AMARAL: I have four people that
2 have signed up to speak, so I would imagine that,
3 and, actually, David Henkin's going to come back a
4 second time, so there will be five speakers, and
5 then after that we're going to bring this to a
6 close.

7 I didn't have the chance, it slipped my
8 mind, I'm getting old, to tell you there is another
9 transcriber, and she's located in the back room
10 there, so if you didn't want to speak on the record
11 here in front of everyone, you can easily go to
12 that back room and the transcriber will take your
13 testimony there for the record. We will tell you,
14 also, that this is not your last opportunity to
15 comment, pick up a copy of the report, and you can
16 send your comments in writing to the website that
17 is on one of those displays.

18 And I want to give Kehau another
19 opportunity to come up and once again make the
20 announcement about elelo Hawaii.

21 KEHAU PUU NAPUELUA: Aloha, I'm Kehau
22 Napuelua, and I will be here on the side, I'm the
23 Hawaiian language translator today, and I'll be
24 here on the side for those of you wishing to give
25 testimony in Hawaiian. Please come and see me so

Comments

34

1 we can discuss a process for that. Mahalo.
2 ANNELLE AMARAL: Mahalo. All right.
3 Here we go now. So just a reminder again, the
4 ground rules are you wait to be recognized before
5 you speak. I'll be calling the speakers in the
6 order that they signed up, we're here talking to
7 one another, let's listen well, let's speak well,
8 let's treat one another with respect. It's
9 understood that not everyone agrees on issues in
10 this room, we will disagree with one other, but
11 it's not necessary for us to be disagreeable with
12 one another, so let us say our peace, our mana'o,
13 accept it for what it is, and pau. Let's not
14 engage one another, speak your truth, we hear it,
15 it's on the record, that should be sufficient. I
16 will interrupt anyone who tries to interrupt the
17 speaker, and we will not proceed until that speaker
18 can proceed uninterrupted.
19 And, finally, the most important rule is
20 be kind to the facilitator and the facilitator will
21 be kind to you, I promise.
22 Our next speaker is Mr. Albert Silva
23 followed by Mr. Vince Dodge.
24 Mr. Silva, aloha.
25

Responses

Comments

35

1 ALBERT SILVA: Aloha everyone. It gives
2 me a chance to speak on, say, my behalf and my
3 ohana, you might not know, but my lineage runs on
4 the Waianae Coast for at least 200 years. I am the
5 first male since it got in the hands of the
6 wahines, and we know that the wahines are like the
7 beautiful flower and the kane is like the bee,
8 that's our analogy of life or our existence.

9 My efforts today is to give you or share
10 with you not so much criticisms in any negative way
11 but to bring to you a message from the way I've
12 experienced my life here on the Waianae Coast.

13 I was born here, like I said, I was born
14 here September 15th, 1929. I grew up going to
15 Makua from Waianae from when I first can remember,
16 it was a dirt road and lots of ohiki, ohiki the
17 crab, thousands of them at Ohikilolo. Fortunately,
18 I've lived long enough to witness a lot, a lot that
19 I was always concerned about, and it's part of me,
20 my interest, my way of life, the hills, the
21 mountains, the bush, the water, the wind, the rain,
22 the ocean, but Makua in particular was my favorite
23 place as a child, like I repeat, maybe at around
24 four years old, as I can recall, opening the gate
25 at Ohikilolo that I thought I could do but my

Responses

Comments

Responses

36

1 mother insisted that I couldn't and she was right,
2 I tried to pick up that gate and open it so we
3 could drive through, and I think I was around five
4 years old, at least, at that time.

5 But, Makua, the place where like only the
6 hermits maybe wanted to live, there was that church
7 there, the graveyard, they talk about the muluwai,
8 yeah, my brother went in that muluwai and caught a
9 lot of fish in there, net, and the paipai -- the
10 cowboys, he was a cowboy on the ranch, the cowboys
11 would paipai the fish into the net and plenty fish,
12 plenty kaukau. If you wanted meat, then go on up
13 the hill with a 22 and got a goat, whenever they
14 wanted meat.

15 But then times were not like the way it
16 is now. I am sad to say the way Makua was at my
17 beginnings was very rough, lots of brush, opala,
18 blue bushes, lantana, and the pipi, the cattle,
19 weren't fat like they are now, there wasn't the
20 grasses. The grasses right now is just like, go
21 down to the best golf course you have here on this
22 coast and the grass there is growing that thick,
23 although these grasses out there is heartier, it
24 can take the drought. The grasses we had before
25 was simple foptails that stuck to your pants when

Comments

Responses

37

1 you went walking through it, now, it just changed
2 so much, and I tell you what, 90 percent of the
3 change, the beauty, the so pretty valley that you
4 can see, that you notice, is all because the care
5 that the U.S. Army has done. They send people up
6 there not only to protect the plants but to take
7 care of the aina. Hey, tell me who can take care
8 of the aina like the Army does here at Makua. If
9 we are not grateful for the way they take care of
10 the aina, that all the people around in the
11 community here that have beautiful little yards,
12 maybe five feet from their house around the yard,
13 but that's all they can afford to take care of, but
14 the Army takes care of a few hundred acres. Aren't
15 we fortunate, aren't we lucky? Somebody might
16 think, you know, no, we're not lucky, but the point
17 is how beautiful Makua is now compared to the way
18 it was when I was a keiki, and this is something
19 that we all should be thanking the Army for, trying
20 to make this effort, not only to train our soldiers
21 but to maintain the aina, stewards of the land.

22 We hear about it, we want to be
23 Hawaiians, we always say, hey, take care of the
24 aina so the aina take care of you, but a lot of
25 people, we should be grateful for the way the Army