

Comments

81

1 Nemeth.

2 DR. LIU: Aloha. (Speaking Hawaiian.) I'm not
3 from Waianae, but I came here to support the people of
4 Waianae and especially to try and add some manao from a
5 health perspective. I could do it from the law
6 perspective but in law school I remember studying the
7 EIS process and
8 wondering -- (speaking Hawaiian.)

9 In the end, you cannot stop them. (Inaudible.)
10 What justice is there? Anyway -- okay.

11 I'd just like to throw in some points from the
12 perspective of a (inaudible). I think most people in
13 the room are aware the extremely poor health statistics
14 of kanaka maoli -- diabetes, hypertension, hypoglycemia,
15 coronary artery disease, myocardial infarction, stroke,
16 kidney disease.

17 Across the board, it's not -- it's no surprise
18 to anyone but what might be surprising that -- I believe
19 this is -- what's happening to the aina and that's the
20 fact that's really missing from the EIS -- the overall
21 picture. The picture that describes the aina as kuaana,
22 as elder siblings to humans -- as elder siblings to
23 kanaka maoli.

24 And in that way, there is no sacred land because
25 all land is sacred. There is no site that can be

Responses

T57-1

Chapter 5 of the Draft EIS provides an analysis relating to the cumulative impacts of the proposed action.

T57-1

Comments

82

1 identified separately out because all sites, all parts
2 of the aina,
3 all the pohaku, all the moana, all the kai, everything
4 is sacred.

5 To say that there will be limited or no impact
6 it's simply a lie. And I'd like to further kind of
7 expand on that by putting us to the theory of cultural
8 trauma. That is the damage that was done -- starting
9 not only in 1893, but we forget to see that the
10 ancestors of the
11 U.S. military -- General Schofield after which the
12 Barracks was named came as a spy to Hawaii -- invited as
13 a guest and came to spy on Hawaii to sort out the
14 military plans for Pearl Harbor. The military -- U.S.
15 military impacts on Hawaii has been ongoing for longer
16 than 1893 and continues today.

17 How does that lead to health? Well, the theory
18 of cultural trauma says that impacts that are felt by
19 people, such as the overthrow of the monarchy, such as
20 invasion, such as the continuing presence of the U.S.
21 military are subconsciously caught and transmitted to
22 generation to generations. It subconsciously is passed
23 from generation
24 to generation.

25 And how are these subimpacts felt? Well, they

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T57-2

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

T57-2

Comments

83

Responses

1 are exhibited as behaviors of resistance. And when one
2 has the tools of resistance, we are in a struggle such
3 as in Palestine or other parts. We find our own ways of
4 resisting.

5 Some of those ways of resisting are
6 unfortunately very unhealthy. For example, substance
7 abuse; for example, not going to Western doctors or not
8 taking medications.

9 And so these behaviors are behaviors of resistance.

10 Well, to a Western mind or to the mind of a
11 settler or occupier are very unrational -- in fact,
12 extremely irrational in the internal logic of the
13 occupied of the people. And so it's no wonder that
14 kanaka maoli have the worse health statistics in the
15 archipelago. Why? Because we are the kanaka maoli and
16 only occupy the people in the archipelago.

17 Just kind of to close, I thought it was -- you
18 know, I was looking at all the news happening in
19 Palestine and
20 how Israelis are finally withdrawing and how the
21 Israelis openly called themselves settlers. And I would
22 look across the table at the people in uniform and would
23 ask them to call themselves what they are. They are
24 settlers. They
25 are uninvited. They, like the Israelis, came in,

Comments

84

1 occupied land, have their military installations,
2 practice continued acts of genocide, and they are --
3 they are unhealthy.

4 So I would ask that they -- as the Israelis are
5 doing, start to withdraw peacefully. Mahalo.

6 FACILITATOR GOMES: Dr. Kit Glover.

7 DR. GLOVER: Aloha.

8 To add to the previous speaker's comments about
9 the fact that the EIS hasn't included the comparison of
10 the incidents of anemia, leukemia, and cancer. All of
11 which
12 can be increased by the things that are reported in this
13 as -- like cadmium and lead and arsenic.

14 There also is an incidence of depression which
15 I'm sure of any -- any Department of Health statistician
16 can find is incredibly higher in the people in this
17 community and other communities that have been exposed
18 to the military's use of the toxins that they have.

19 Depression has a higher incidence with diabetes.
20 We know diabetes is higher in Hawaiians. It's just that
21 whole thing has not been explored.

22 I have been to the previous two evening meetings
23 and I don't recall that anybody mentioned about the
24 possible interconnections of the aqua. I'm not sure any
25 study has been done. There have been many references in

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T57-3

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

T58-1

The hydrogeologic assessment represents a widespread evaluation of the potential for contamination as reflected in Appendix G-1. Sampling was conducted of soil, sediment, surface water, and groundwater with no pattern of contamination that would impact off-site receptors. Arsenic is not a significant constituent of military ordinance, and therefore arsenic concentrations are not expected to increase as a result of the project. Lead was not detected above preliminary remediation goals or drinking water standards in any of the water samples. If lead were migrating, it would have to show up in at least a few samples collected and analyzed by the laboratory at concentrations of concern. Lead is not a mobile compound in solution, and the EIS's assessment that lead is not a contaminant of concern to off-site receptors is consistent with data from other ranges.

Comments

85

T58-2

1 other meetings that I've attended to possible
 2 interconnections. Some of them even say that the
 3 drinking water may be affected from people on the -- for
 4 people on the Windward side due to interconnections, but
 5 I think that definitely should be checked out.

6 And the last thing I want to mention is that --
 7 Mr. Prescott, you might think about this in connection
 8 with some of your conclusions and see if you want to
 9 amend them
 10 a bit.

11 The population of this small island in 1900 was
 12 58,504. The -- and between 1900 and 1950, it was when
 13 the military was allowed to start using Makua for
 14 live-fire training. So the population pressure didn't
 15 -- wasn't nearly as apparent then as it is now.

16 In 1950, it had increased from 58,000 and some
 17 to 87,000 and some. That's like where there was one
 18 person on this island and now in 1950 there were
 19 one-and-a-half persons. But now the population pressure
 20 is not only evidenced by the skyrocketing increase in
 21 land taxation and in rent, that many, many poor people
 22 can't pay. It has
 23 been mentioned by the previous speaker's references to
 24 houseless people.

25 There is now -- compared between 1950 and 2000,

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T58-2

The hydrogeologic investigation shows that groundwater beneath the site flows toward the west, to the ocean. There is, accordingly, a lack of interconnection between the aquifers in the Waianae Coast and the Windward side, and therefore no further study is warranted. See Appendix G-1.

Comments

86

T58-3

1 there are four people for every one that there were. So
 2 comparing it since 1900, there are, like, better than
 3 six people for everyone. So we need that land. The
 4 population pressure needs it.

5 FACILITATOR GOMES: The next person is Summer
 6 Nemeth followed by Kahele Saito and Leandra Wai.

7 MS. NEMETH: Aloha. Before I introduce myself,
 8 I would like to address what I hope is an error on the
 9 Executive Summary, page 26.

T59-1

10 I quote, "MMR fits in the area between Pokai Bay
 11 and Kaena Point which is all considered sacred land, or
 12 wahi pani." Mistake or not, there is kauna in that wahi
 13 pani.

14 Yes, Makua is closed to kanaka maoli unless the
 15 military lets us in. I was in an access last year. My
 16 ohana and I were waiting outside the gate. And we were
 17 verbally threatened by soldiers on the opposite side and
 18 they had shot at us with imaginary machine guns okay. I
 19 am a victim of militarization.

20 Aloha. My name is Summer Nemeth. I'm the
 21 daughter of Fred Mullen (phonetic) who is the son of
 22 Louis A.
 23 Helinee (phonetic), born in Wahiawa, Hawaii. She is the
 24 daughter of Quincy Helinee who was born, raised, and
 25 buried at Makua. He was the son of Solomon and Huna of

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T58-3

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

T59-1

The EIS text will be revised to address a typographical error with respect to the Hawaiian term wahi pana.

Comments

87

1 Makua

2 born, raised, and buried.

3 I can't tell you how difficult it is for me to
4 be there at that valley and to know that my family once
5 lived there. I have a picture of their house
6 (indicating). And what I know about the history of this
7 house is that a white cross was put on the roof, and it
8 was used as a bombing target.

9 My kupuna are devastated by that loss. They're
10 devastated because they were removed from the aina where
11 a generation of my family lived.

12 Besides the fact that I have been disconnected
13 from my ohana and continue to be limited in my access to
14 the
15 aina of my ohana and my awe of my kupuna. I have a few
16 other concerns that I would like to address to you in
17 the form of questions.

T59-2 | 18 One, has the Army completed an archeological
19 survey -- completed archeological survey -- excuse me.

T59-3 | 20 Number two, has the Army completed subsurface
21 testing?

T59-4 | 22 Number three, has the Army test the sea life in
23 the ocean fronting Makua?

T59-5 | 24 Number four, has the Army surveyed the entire
25 valley?

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T59-2

Surface surveys have been completed for the entire area within the south firebreak road except for those areas containing improved conventional munitions. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the majority of the surface danger zone of the 105mm round. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the Ukanipo Heiau complex, Koiahi Gulch and almost all of Kahanahaiki Valley. This coverage is reflected in Figures 3-24 and 3-25 in the Draft EIS.

Subsurface testing has been undertaken in Sites 4243, 4244, 4245 and 4246. This testing showed there is a subsurface component to these sites; however, this limited testing resulted in protests from two Native Hawaiians due to the invasive and destructive nature of the testing.

An additional subsurface archaeological survey was conducted in November and December of 2006. The results of this survey have been incorporated into Section 3.10, and the survey report is included as Appendix G-9.

The Army has completed all surface and subsurface archaeological surveys consistent with NEPA and the settlement agreements with Malama Makua.

T59-3

Please see the response to Comment T59-2.

T59-4

Under this EIS, the Army conducted the Hydrogeologic Investigation at Makua (report is Appendix G-1 of the Draft EIS), and the Muliwai Sediment Study in the Makua Beach area (report is Appendix G-3 of the Draft EIS.). The analytical results did not show sufficient intensity of measured concentration nor enough frequency of detection to suspect any potential for adverse ecological effects that might enter the human food chain through ingestion of fish or limu.

Comments

Responses

(Cont.)

T59-4

This assessment confirms the EPA's findings and conclusion in 1999 when the muliwai were sampled and tested for metals: "further investigation does not appear warranted at this time because the overall concentrations of the metals are relatively low, and do not tend to indicate a significant adverse impact on ecoreceptors" (USEPA 1999a).

An additional marine resources survey was conducted in August 2006, and the investigation report is included in Appendix G-8.

T59-5

Please see the response to Comment T59-2.

Comments

Responses

1 I can give you the answer to these questions.
 2 It's no. And therefore, the EIS is incomplete and
 3 inadequate.

4 Despite the fact that the EIS has failed to
 5 cover those previous concerns, I would like to address
 6 the following quotes, "significant and unmitigable
 7 impacts on ATI that include burials." That's not
 8 acceptable. At
 9 least three generations of my ohana are in that valley
 10 and that's just my ohana. There were many other
 11 families
 12 living in that valley before them.

13 This fact disproves a statement on page 14 of
 14 the Executive Summary that the cultural resources
 15 management program focuses on protecting areas of
 16 traditional importance. Aole. That's a lie. You are
 17 not protecting ewe kupuna. You are desecrating them
 18 along with the entire ATI of Makua. These sites are not
 19 just piles of rocks.

20 I want to also address the failure to look into
 21 the impact your soldiers have on the wahi pani off
 22 Kaena. This place is close to me too because it's a
 23 place that my
 24 family began to visit after they were forced to leave
 25 Makua. It is a place that we can return to the realm of

T59-6

Section 4.10 has been revised to identify significant and unmitigable impacts for Areas of Traditional Importance and archaeological resources, as well as mitigation measures for these impacts.

T59-6

T59-6

T59-6

Comments

Responses

1 whole.
 2 And according to your EIS, Kaena and Puaokala
 3 would be used to march through to Mokuleia to Makua.
 4 Aue. Where is the culture documentation for this wahi
 5 pani? What impact will your training have? You need to
 6 learn to educate yourselves.

T59-6

7 The military already has a history at Kaena, and
 8 I'm not going to share that with you today because I
 9 only have

10 a minute left. But I can tell you about one unmitigable
 11 impact that I have seen at Kaena -- soldiers driving
 12 their
 13 4 x 4s in the sand dunes and turning them into mud bogs.
 14 I don't know -- I think you need to look into the
 15 significance of those sand dunes. I'm not going to go
 16 into that.

T59-7

17 I've also seen them burning huge sets of pallets
 18 leaving rusted nails, metal, glass and other opala for
 19 keiki to step on. I clean up there. Uneducated solders
 20 at Kaena -- they do not have any concern or respect for
 21 this aina, and I do not trust they will have -- they
 22 will in any way gain respect by marching through it.

T59-8

23 Lastly, I have been to Makua. I have seen the
 24 impacts the military has had on this valley. It is not
 25 pono. Military training at Makua needs to stop.

T59-9

T59-7

As stated on Page 2-13 of the Draft EIS, there would be no training on Makua Beach. Driving 4 x 4s in the sand dunes at Kaena Point is not a part of the proposed action. Future situations of this nature should be immediately reported to the Army's Public Affairs Office and include the bumper numbers of the vehicles involved, so that appropriate action can be taken.

T59-8

This type of activity is not proposed as part of training at MMR is not authorized by Army commanders. Future situations of this nature should be immediately reported to the Army's Public Affairs Office and include the bumper numbers of the vehicles involved, so that appropriate action can be taken.

T59-9

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

Responses

1 Please kokua, clean up, and leave.

2 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo. The next person is
3 Kahele Saito followed by Leandra Wai and Dr. Fred Dodge.

4 MS. SAITO: Aloha. (Speaking Hawaiian.)

5 First of all, I'd just like to mahalo (speaking
6 Hawaiian). Mahalo kupuna. Mahalo makua. Mahalo to our
7 kupuna have been with us, that have come before us and
8 have set this path for us. Mahalo to all of you
9 warriors who have -- people like Frenchy, Bill Aila, and
10 Uncle Sparky Rodrigues and because of you that I stand
11 here today. It's a place that it's a half way for those
12 who don't. I stand here and pretending -- all those who
13 cannot come here and all of my ohana.

14 It's my first time testifying and I didn't
15 prepare anything. But truthfully, I think that this
16 whole process is just ludicrous. It's ridiculous. I
17 don't even understand why we have to even go through
18 this.

19 My personal understanding of this whole process
20 -- and I've read parts of the Stryker Brigade EIS, parts
21 of
22 the Mauna Kea Outrigger Telescope EIS, and I refuse to
23 read this one because I know it's all the same. It's
24 the same thing.

25 EIS has proposed -- whatever it is your

Responses

1 expansion here. You waste paper and make these huge
2 volumes of which is just ridiculous material for us to
3 read. You tell us everything that you are going to do
4 to, all the devastation that you're going to do to our
5 aina and then you bring us here -- you know, which I am
6 glad -- I'm very honored to be here. And I will, you
7 know, continue to be here for the next few years -- for
8 the rest of my life, you know.

9 But it's a ridiculous process because over --
0 you know, all of this we're doing you're still going to
1 make your record of decision. You're still going to go
2 on expanding, and you're still going to be doing -- you
3 know, bringing this hewa to our people and to our aina.

4 I want you to understand that we will be here.
5 You know, these guys have put their blood, sweat, and
6 tears all these years, and I honor them. And I -- you
7 know, I look
8 at you guys with the most humblest accord and in that I
9 too stride to spend the rest of my life protecting this
10 aina -- protecting this place for my home, for my keiki,
11 and for my (speaking Hawaiian).

12 All these places, you know -- mahalo to the
13 Malama Makua ohana -- all these places that you have
14 just devastated -- places like Poihale, from which my
15 family comes from, places like Moku, places --

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 Pohakuloa, which
2 I was able to visit -- places like Makua, like Kahuku.
3 You guys have continuously -- since the first day you
4 guys set foot on our aina, you guys will continue to do
5 it. But we will continue to be here and stand here and
6 fight and protect what is ours. This is ours not yours.

7 So I end and mahalo to all of you guys. And on
8 behalf of my kupuna and from where I come from in my
9 ohana, I end with how Uncle Bill started his testimony.

10 (Speaking Hawaiian.)

T60-1 11 You know what -- save Makua and the rest of our
12 aina from further militarization from your U.S. empire.

13 FACILITATOR GOMES: I'm sorry but our agreement
14 is no signs up front. Next person is Leandra Wai
15 followed by Fred Dodge.

16 MS. WAI: I have to take off my glasses so I can
17 see up front. I'm just getting used to this. I wish I
18 didn't have to but here goes.

19 You know, I just found two (speaking Hawaiian)
20 and I hope I can do this right. Okay. I already cried.

21 (Speaking Hawaiian.)

22 I have been observing during the training of the
23 Army scoping for this EIS till October 4 when their
24 agreement to stop training -- was to stop training if
25 the EIS was not completed.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T60-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

Responses

T61-1

1 I gave testimony on air sampling quality being
2 deficient, lacking important data which I will bring to
3 our experts.

T61-2

4 Another point I want to speak on is social
5 impacts, psychological impacts. The two before me are
6 examples of those psychological impacts. The (speaking
7 Hawaiian) on
8 the floor there. The (speaking Hawaiian) is an example
9 of social impacts.

10 Okay. Anyhow, during that time of observation,
11 I experienced much harassment to me, but I thought it
12 was
13 okay because I was chosen to be there to observe the
14 military. And military people didn't like civilian
15 suing the military for information over a pile of rocks.
16 So I took it.

17 But after that it didn't stop. There was an
18 incident just three weeks ago or during the last
19 three-day holiday at Makua couple months ago maybe even
20 less. I
21 don't know time is just going by so fast. It happened
22 when I saw the beach was really full. All the areas
23 were taken. The favorite areas and even the non-favorite
24 areas. There was a convoy of five military cars. They
25 kept going in circles looking for their place and the

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T61-1

The air sampling at MMR was conducted in accordance with the sampling and analysis plan (SAP), which was amended after the public review and comment period (60 days). The amended SAP was followed, and the results collected characterized the events during which the monitoring was conducted.

T61-2

The assessment of the psychological impacts of the presence of the military in Hawaii on the civilian population is outside the scope of this EIS. The focus of NEPA is on the environment. Pursuant to CEQ Regulations 40 CFR Part 1500, "NEPA is our basic national charter for protection of the environment." "The NEPA process is intended to help public officials make decisions that are based on understanding of environmental consequences, and take actions that protect, restore, and enhance the environment."

Responses

1 only place they could see was on the beach.

2 So upon seeing that, I went over to talk to them
3 to ascertain why were they circling because it doesn't
4 look so good, too many people on the beach, maybe cars
5 broke into.

6 So they told me that they was trying to get down there.

7 And so I let them know that it was illegal to do that.

8 They didn't give a shit. You know what they did? They
9 found the nearest opening and sped on the beach and
10 missed

11 a child by six inches.

12 And the family was really upset. They got their
13 family and friends and went over and talked to the guys
14 to put some restraints in them and sensitivity. Well,
15 these military thought it's best not to react at that
16 point. Instead they waited till family left, waited for
17 the people around me left then sped by and stoned my
18 car. I told Colonel Killian about this. And he told me
19 call him. I don't have a phone. There's no phone in
20 Makua.

21 So my question is, with this military seizing
22 our lands, bombing our sites -- or over our sites, wild
23 fire threatening our endangered species to the place of
24 extinction, who is going to protect us? And the
25 military

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T61-3

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. In addition, Section 4.14.1 describes the impact methodology for wildfires. Section 4.14.3 describes the mitigation for wildfires. In addition, Appendix J addresses wildfire methodology and impacts to natural resources. To the extent changes are made to the IWFMP, such changes would be made in coordination with the USFWS, thus giving the USFWS the opportunity to fully evaluate the adequacy of the impact methodology and mitigation proposals.

T61-3

Responses

T61-4

1 is competing for our recreational land on top of that.
 2 And you know what, there might have been another
 3 person standing at that moment. What if that person --
 4 innocent people. So my point is, things are escalating
 5 already and you even -- and you haven't even gone back
 6 to practice -- how are you going to mitigate that?
 7 Because
 8 I'm concerned. Everybody is tense and so are your
 9 people. They think that they have a right to these
 10 lands. And we should go away.

T61-2

11 But I just needed to tell you of that because it
 12 needs to be in the EIS. That the social impacts of your
 13 presence in Makua is escalating.
 14 Okay. Let's see, you know, I got to do that. I
 15 dream of doing that.
 16 Okay. From being an observer, I also observed
 17 going around with Laurie Lucking, Dave (inaudible)
 18 during that time, cataloging the sites that they did
 19 find. I have to tell you our public, our people who are
 20 beneficiaries of everything in Makua that what I've
 21 witnessed is some very unique formations, and I shared
 22 it with Laurie because I really didn't think I had a
 23 place in doing that.
 24 They have -- our people had advance knowledge on
 25 how to use a dry land area harvesting water and mist.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T61-4

The Army does not authorize this type of behavior and instructs its personnel to respect the environment, the community, and individuals. Future situations of this nature should be immediately reported to the Army's Public Affairs Office and include the license plate numbers of the vehicles involved, so that appropriate action can be taken.

Responses

1 So I'm saying that these sites are really important even
2 if you don't think they are. The knowledge of using the
3 mist and the dew is very important to us. We would like
4 to regain that knowledge.

5 So I guess this is a good time to present the
6 boards that people have been wielding around. It's not
7 as pretty as yours but you know, it's what we have. And
8 it's what we've been involved with all this time. It's
9 our practice. That's what we would like. We would like
10 to -- we see it
11 as a place where we go and learn. We even go and learn
12 political science. How to relate to you to understand
13 you. So we can help mitigate our kuleana.

14 Thank you for listening to me.

15 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo. Next person is Dr.
16 Fred Dodge.

17 DR. DODGE: Aloha kakou, everyone.

18 I'm not sure I'm going to be the last person but
19 thank you all for staying this long and listening to
20 this.

21 I'm going to refer to something I haven't for
22 quite a while. And that is that I too have had members
23 of my family in the military. My brother was seriously
24 injured
25 in World War II. I was in the Army, served overseas

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Comments

Responses

97

1 including Korea many moons ago -- over 50 years ago.

2 Just to say that this is not unique, we heard
3 from Kawika also and also from Fred Cachola who served.
4 And Sparky didn't say anything but I know he was in
5 Vietnam.

6 So you're having a wide range of community people talk
7 with you today including veterans, the young, the
8 aunties, kupuna. And I think the message is pretty
9 clear. We see you as an occupation -- an occupying
10 force.

11 And it is time to re-evaluate the way you see
12 yourselves. And to go back in history to the way the
13 U.S. obtained Hawaii to the overthrow, the theft of a
14 nation,
15 and go forward from there to see where your position is,
16 and how so many of us in the community understand that
17 and wishing you to do that also. I know you're under
18 other orders and yet the understanding of that is
19 crucial.

20 Again, I may be the last person to say this, and
21 I took a little bit of heart in hearing you say that you
22 are considering giving us extra time. We really need
23 that full 120 days for the comment period. And as I
24 mentioned at my last testimony, we do have experts on
25 board that need that time also, and I won't go into it

T62-1

The Army extended the public review period from 60 days to 75 days. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

T62-1

Comments

98

1 further.

2 But please, please, give us that. Again, there
3 have been so many great testimony here today both
4 showing the spirit and as well as honing down on the EIS
5 itself.

T62-2

6 So please take to heart the things that you've
7 heard and go back to the drawing board if you persist in
8 doing this EIS which I think you will. We really need
9 to do have a complete and sufficient one as was promised
10 to us.

11 I might also add that I believe I read it in
12 there you did have it but you minimize it, but when the
13 military took over Makua in early 1943, they did sign an
14 agreement with the Territorial Government to leave Makua
15 six months after the war ended. So again, almost 60
16 years you've overstayed.

T62-3

17 But we do want to have accurate knowledge of all
18 the archeological sites as promised and as written in
19 the Settlement Agreement.

T62-4

20 We need to have answers to why you need to train
21 there and convenience which it seems to me as the main
22 answer at this point -- it's not enough. It may be
23 inconvenient -- more inconvenient go to someplace else
24 but that should be included in a full EIS.

T62-5

25 We want further studies on biological receptors

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T62-2

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act and with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T62-3

Surface surveys have been completed for the entire area within the south firebreak road except for those areas containing improved conventional munitions. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the majority of the surface danger zone of the 105mm round. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the Ukanipo Heiau complex, Koiahi Gulch and almost all of Kahanahaiki Valley. This coverage is reflected in Figures 3-24 and 3-25 in the Draft EIS.

Subsurface testing has been undertaken in Sites 4243, 4244, 4245 and 4246. This testing showed there is a subsurface component to these sites; however, this limited testing resulted in protests from two Native Hawaiians due to the invasive and destructive nature of the testing.

An additional subsurface archaeological survey was conducted in November and December of 2006. The results of this survey have been incorporated into Section 3.10, and the survey report is included as Appendix G-9.

The Army has completed all surface and subsurface archaeological surveys consistent with NEPA and the settlement agreements with Malama Makua.

T62-4

The purpose and need for the proposed action were described in Sections 1.2 and 1.3 of the Draft EIS. The EIS considered other training locations in Section 2.5. Based on the analysis in the section, the Army determined that MMR satisfies the purpose and need for the proposed action.

Responses

T62-5

1 in the muliwai and in our oceans fronting Makua.

T62-6

2 We want to have good hydrological studies. I'm
3 not an expert in water contamination, but we do have at
4 least one on board and a preliminary view of that
5 person, I understand, is that the those studies -- the
6 hydrological studies are flawed.

T62-7

7 Also, we want to know the relation to the
8 Stryker Brigade. It keeps coming up because it's
9 important.

10 The lease in Makua expires in 2029. I think
11 it's August 29th. We are just about there. It's only
12 24 more years. And it may seem like a lot of time but
13 it isn't.

T62-8

14 It's going to go by fast. That's not too early to clean
15 up. Give us a plan of clean up and being prepared to
16 leave. Earlier would be nice but at least by that time,
17 please.

18 So again, I urge you to go back to the drawing
19 board, come up with a document that is complete, full,
20 sufficient, honest. And then go further, do your
21 homework on how to clean up the valley and prepare to
22 leave.

23 Mahalo. Aloha for your patience.

24 FACILITATOR GOMES: As Fred says he's probably
25 not the final speaker. At this time, we'd like to call

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T62-5

Under this EIS, the Army conducted the Hydrogeologic Investigation at Makua (report is Appendix G-1 of the Draft EIS), and the Muliwai Sediment Study in the Makua Beach area (report is Appendix G-3 of the Draft EIS.). The analytical results did not show sufficient intensity of measured concentration nor enough frequency of detection to suspect any potential for adverse ecological effects that might enter the human food chain through ingestion of fish or limu. This assessment confirms the EPA's findings and conclusion in 1999 when the muliwai were sampled and tested for metals: "further investigation does not appear warranted at this time because the overall concentrations of the metals are relatively low, and do not tend to indicate a significant adverse impact on ecoreceptors" (USEPA 1999a).

An additional marine resources survey was conducted in August 2006, and the investigation report is included in Appendix G-8.

T62-6

The sampling plan, into which public comments were incorporated, was designed to sample all media that are likely to have contamination, i.e. air, soil, sediment, ground water and surface water. Further, samples were collected in the areas of concentrated training, as well as background areas to identify potential "hot spots". The representative sampling scheme was performed and data analysis showed no potential for contamination to impact off-site receptors. See Appendix G-1.

T62-7

Because the actions proposed for MMR and SBCT are not connected, separate EIS were prepared for those projects. While those projects were designed so either one could be implemented independently of the other, SBCT forces may use MMR if the ranges are available after completion of the MMR EIS and ROD.

Comments

Responses

(Cont.)

T62-7

Accordingly, the MMR EIS contains an analysis of the potential environmental impacts associated with dismantled CALFEXs for current forces and SBCT forces. See Chapter 5.

T62-8

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your recommendations and will consider them as it moves forward with the NEPA process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. At this time, because cleanup is not proposed, and because an estimate of costs associated with any potential cleanup activities is speculative, the EIS has not been revised to include this estimate.

Responses

100

1 up
2 Julie Cachola whose father spoke earlier this morning
3 today.

4 MS. CACHOLA: Aloha. Hello everyone. My name
5 is Julie Cachola. I was born and raised in Waianae,
6 still a resident here. I'd just like to say that the
7 draft EIS is inadequate pursuant to the regulations that
8 govern its preparation -- basically the NEPA and the
9 council on environmental quality regulations parts 1500
10 to 1508.

11 The very premise of this draft EIS is a framing
12 of the proposed action. In this framing of the proposed
13 action violates the regulations governing of the
14 preparation of this document.

15 See this document is supposed to by their own
16 regulations -- supposed to be done before a decision is
17 made. It's supposed to not only disclose impacts. It's
18 supposed to be a decision making tool.

19 The proposed action in this EIS is to conduct
20 the necessary type, level, duration, and intensity of
21 live
22 fire, and other military training exercises at MMR --
23 Makua -- for the combat assigned to the 25th Infantry
24 Division and for other military units to maintain the
25 combat readiness of those units. The purpose is to

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T63-1

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act and with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate. The EIS, moreover, considered other training locations in Section 2.5. Based on the analysis in the section, the Army determined that MMR satisfies the purpose and need for the proposed action.

T63-1

Responses

T63-2

1 enable combat readiness.

2 There is a problem in this proposed action
3 because of the word MMR -- the acronym MMR. The remedy
4 is to
5 delete that. So your proposed action is to look at
6 locations for the necessary type, level, duration, and
7 intensity of live fire and other military training
8 exercises for the combat units.

9 What we have here -- the proposed -- it's
10 called, like, circular reasoning where in the statement
11 itself is the solution. So like "a" causes "b", "b"
12 causes "a." So when you get to the identification of
13 alternatives, you cannot have a meaningful discussion of
14 alternatives because you've already decided Makua is
15 where you have to go.

T63-1

16 Now, let's look at that. Pursuant to the
17 preparation requirements in your own regulations, that
18 is not what this document is intended to be. It is not
19 supposed to be something that justifies a decision that
20 has already been made. And it is clear by the framing
21 of the question that the decision at Makua has already
22 been made.

23 Whether we look at different alternatives of
24 this fire, more fire, or even more fire is not a look at
25 reasonable alternatives. I didn't know we have time

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T63-2

Throughout the National Environmental Policy Act process, beginning with the Notice of Intent, the Army has consistently stated that its proposed action is to train at MMR. The EIS, moreover, considered other training locations in Section 2.5. Based on the analysis in the section, the Army determined that MMR satisfies the purpose and need for the proposed action.

Responses

1 limits here.

2 So basically, the requirements say -- and I'll
3 quote from it, "The identification of proposed action
4 alternative is the heart of what this Environmental
5 Impact Statement is supposed to involve." It is the
6 heart of it.

T63-1

7 And as I've said, there is no meaningful
8 discussion on that because the decision has already been
9 made for Makua. This is circular reasoning. For this
10 reason, I think -- everything that follows is
11 inadequate.

12 I ran some cursing numbers using EIS maps, and
13 I've noticed the federal government chose 21 percent of
14 the
15 acres or 56,000 acres on Oahu, 347,000 acres on -- in
16 statewide. There are 17 parcels that have acreage
17 larger than 1,100 acres. We are looking at 1,136 as the
18 magic number somehow.

T63-1

19 Ten of these 17 parcels are on this island.
20 What I'm saying is, there could be a meaningful
21 discussion on 17 different alternatives here. But
22 because the decision -- the decision has already been
23 made for Makua, we don't have a meaningful discussion
24 about alternatives.

25 There are other kind of alternatives you should

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

103

1 also look at. How many of you guys play video games?
2 You know, they are taking simulations to new heights.
3 You can feel every bump in the road, every wind
4 condition -- I mean, certainly there are software
5 companies that can help you with this. It should be
6 identified.

7 I'd like to talk about areas of traditional
8 importance, ATIs. It may sound like UFOs. ATIs are
9 things that we believe in as Hawaiians that maybe other
10 people don't recognize, but they'll say maybe so -- so
11 they call
12 it ATIs.

13 That is the crux of the issue, you see. Because
14 there is a cultural difference here. In fact, Waianae
15 census division here is comprised of 22.9 percent Native
16 Hawaiians. This is compared to 5.6 Native Hawaiians
17 islandwide if you're looking at percentage. There is a
18 high percentage of Native Hawaiians here. So see, when
19 you call visual impact as less than significant, we're
20 looking at it saying, that's ATI, activities of
21 traditional importance to you.

22 It looks strange to us. That doesn't fit the
23 picture in Makua for us. So these visual impacts and
24 everything else impact is highly significant for us.

25 Different concepts -- different perceptions.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T63-3

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. An assessment of visual impacts to the environment is addressed in Section 4.3 of the Draft EIS.

T63-3

Responses

1 Let's look at the acreages from Lualualei to Schofield
2 Barracks. Nearly 17 -- 18,000 acres of contiguous land.
3 All kind of terrain that you would ever want for
4 training.

5 Let's look at Schofield. Now here we would not
6 have cultural clash would we?

7 You -- and look at the cost benefit analysis
8 right there. You don't have to move anywhere. You can
9 have the benefit of added 242 days a year that you can
10 be inundated with this kind of training exercises.

11 Certainly your family and your children would
12 support your need for live ammunition training. That
13 would be more consistent with -- and significantly
14 impact that
15 the -- the Environment Impact Statement would fly
16 through.

17 My time is up. Thank you.

18 FACILITATOR GOMES: The next person is Butch
19 Detroye.

20 MR. DETROYE: Aloha. Okay. I'm going to sing
21 you folks a song if you don't mind. I warn you right
22 away I don't sing too good. I play harmonica. And I
23 don't have
24 to remember words to sing, and my guitar player not
25 here.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 So I have to do this all on my own.

2 This song -- the words for this song came to me,
3 I believe it was July 27th -- the last fire -- the big
4 fire
5 at Makua about two years ago. As I drove down the
6 coastline that evening I seen the smoke. I wasn't even
7 aware of the fire. I seen the smoke coming past Makaha.
8 Went down and they stopped us by the cave, but as I was
9 driving down, the words were already coming to me. So
10 this song is not mine. It's from Makua. So mahalo
11 Makua.

12 Then I thought that night down there we were
13 watching the fire, and I got to talking to Leandra and
14 Gail. And they were telling me about the pueo -- how
15 they seen a pueo fly up over the smoke and the dive into
16 the flames. And there were reasons -- different reasons
17 -- different people have different ideas why the pueo
18 does that.

19 But I was told by one of my kupuna that the pueo
20 is diving into the flames to restore the mana -- to hold
21 the mana within that aina, you know.

22 So the next morning, I went up mauka and sat by
23 the ahu and I finished this song. So this is for all of
24 you folks out there that still have mana as we all do.

25 And I continue to fight and not only save Makua

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 but all the bases on this island. They all need to be
2 shut
3 down one day.
4 (Began singing song.)
5 Makua is crying, desecration blues.
6 Once again it's the same old news.
7 We've seen it done too many times before.
8 Can we feel her crying? How much more?
9 Makua is burning, burning once again.
10 Military practicing, desecration sin.
11 Wake up people got to open our eyes.
12 How long are we going to put up with their lies?
13 What is this madness?
14 What have they done?
15 Just feel her sadness, animals on the run.
16 Makua is burning, got to get out.
17 We're fooling ourselves with our doubt.
18 Come on people just look around.
19 See what they've done this sacred ground.
20 What is this madness?
21 Look what they've done.
22 Just feel her sadness, mana on the run.
23 Pueo flying, way up high.
24 Diving into the flame, right out of the sky.
25 Ohana crying, aumakua dying.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 The arrogant ones just keep on lying.
2 What is this madness?
3 What have they done?
4 Just feel her sadness.
5 Hawaiians on the run.
6 Makua's crying, desecration blues.
7 Once again it's the same old news.
8 We've seen it done so many times before.
9 Can we feel her crying? How much more?
10 Yeah, just feel her crying. How much more?
11 (End of singing song.) Mahalo.
12 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo, Butch. Is there
13 anyone else who would like to comment on the EIS?
14 Mr. Silva?
15 MR. SILVA: Thank you. My name is Albert Silva.
16 Thank you, Frenchy, the mother of OHA, in responding to
17 me. I appreciate it. Distinguished guests. I earlier
18 saw Mr. Bill Paty here. And if he is here my respects
19 to him, too. Panel, aloha to you, too. Malama Makua
20 group, my aloha is with you, too.
21 I am keiki hanau o ka aina. I am a lineal
22 descendant. Aloha.
23 My purpose of willing to stand before the firing
24 squad is because we all gave everybody an equal chance
25 to speak their minds and their souls. Na'e koko. I,

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 for one, appreciate that chance. And that's the purpose
2 I am willing to come up and share with you some of the
3 things that have been going on since this chance of
4 airing your views. Lucky for us that we can do this in
5 this country called America.

6 Again, I'd like to reiterate this chance to
7 speak our mana'o. I have lived here all my life. My
8 ohana goes back at least 200 years. Like the Helenihis.
9 I know of them. They had a little kuleana there in
10 Makua. I know the kuleana, its location, next to the
11 ranch house, the two-story ranch house. At the time I
12 was just a keiki and the Helenihi family would come from
13 Wahiawa. And when they'd come they would go fishing.
14 They were great athletes. They were all lean and lanky.
15 They could run, play volleyball and outstanding
16 athletes, like I said. My aloha to the Heleniki family
17 and other families that were in Makua.

18 But I made my frequent visits there through my
19 family. My mother especially. And I can recall like
20 when I was only four years old that I went there and
21 then later after the ranch was moved to Ohikilolo I went
22 to Makua with the cowboys. We went all over that
23 valley. And what for? To catch the pipi.

24 I think this is referring to somebody else
25 because I know there were a couple of people here that

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 spoke for like 20 minutes. And I probably spoke ten
2 minutes already. Minor. I sat there in my chair all
3 three meetings and watched it happen. So give me a
4 couple minutes, if you would, kindly? I'd appreciate
5 that.

6 And as a keiki, as a youngster 14 years old I
7 would go to Makua with the cowboys and huli pipi. Not
8 really huli. I was the one that huli'd the pipi. 'Cuz
9 the pipi were up in the gulch or wherever and they'd
10 tell me, you go pop them out, you bring them to us, we
11 going to be over here. So kind of direct them that way.
12 And the cowboys would be lay low. And when the cattle
13 came they'd rope them. And I was there.

14 I couldn't throw a rope because I was too damn
15 small. I'd get killed. But I was -- my horse was
16 always fast enough to get behind them pipi. So I'm
17 sharing with you some of my mana'o, my past. And it was
18 good fun. There were a lot of cattle there, horses, and
19 a lot of pigs running around all over the place.

20 And believe me there was one, only one coconut
21 tree that bore fruit, and that was at my mother's
22 ohana's place at Lae'ihau. Lae'ihau is the far end of
23 Makua Valley where my mother's ohana lived. They had
24 one coconut tree that bore fruit. The rest of them were
25 all stunted, if any. And there were mango trees at the

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 Naeiwi residence, the house and the lady Amoi. Sam
2 Pulaole had one tree, the ranch house next to the
3 Nelehili house had one tree, and the Lae'ihau place one
4 tree.

5 So I share with you from those times that when I
6 was a keiki going up into Makua it was rough. It was
7 hihia. Hawaiians call it tangled. Hihia. Lot of bush.
8 Lot of brush. And I carry scars on my arms from the
9 brush.

10 Today I go to Makua, makai, look mauka, look
11 around. Such a pretty valley. I can see why the people
12 then really loved Makua and we know good fishing makai.
13 Good fishing. Excellent fishing. But no more that
14 hihia. Makua is not hihia any more. Makua is like a
15 golf course. I saw it.

16 19 -- I was born 1929. 1935 I was there
17 already. I can remember. But, yeah, I know. But these
18 guys talk for about half an hour and they got away with
19 it. Thank you. So here I go.

20 Makua is so pretty today and I'm grateful that
21 we're getting, or Makua is getting the kind of care and
22 attention that no other place that I know of on this
23 island that gets that kind of care. We got everybody
24 there. We got, you know, the partners people, we got
25 everybody just watching every little detail of what the

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 historical places are, what the sacred places are, and
 2 all of that. They document it, everything. Now, how
 3 lucky for us. It's all being paid for. It's all being
 4 paid for.

5 And it's not gratitude from me but just common
 6 sense that this aina should. World War II they had to
 7 practice, no differences than the tennis players that
 8 want to be way up there and the baseball players that
 9 want to be up there in the big league and make millions.
 10 You have to practice. So I want to give the military,
 11 the Army, A-plus for taking good care of Makua.

12 Although like we know they dropped some bombs.
 13 And that wasn't to bomb in Makua. That's wrong. They
 14 had to offload their planes because wherever they went
 15 they couldn't go land on the landing field with a bomb
 16 attached to the bottom of the plane. So let's get the
 17 record straight. They didn't bomb Makua to bomb Makua,
 18 they bombed to off-load their ammo, their bombs. Makua
 19 wasn't a bombing range. No way. It was a gunnery
 20 range, yes. They shot from the ocean on ships. And
 21 shot at a concrete block that was around 20 feet long
 22 and about ten feet high and about eight feet thick.

23 The Helenihi house didn't get bombed. The
 24 Helenihi house burnt. A church burnt. And why the
 25 church burnt? Because nobody took care of the aina.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

T64-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

T64-1

Comments

Responses

112

1 Nobody went there. Yep, straight scoop. The church
2 burnt because no one took care of the graveyard and all
3 the bushes was growing up alongside the church, past the
4 roof. And when the fire, somebody started the fire,
5 passed the church, and the fire came back and burnt the
6 church. Sorry that happened.

7 I hope one day the Army will help us restore
8 that church. I think they can. They got the engineers
9 and they got -- they have everyone. It was a small
10 church but it was important for us. I have ohana buried
11 there. My mother's ohana. And that's my ohana.

12 So I want to thank everyone for giving me this
13 chance to express my mana'o as everybody else did.
14 Mahalo and aloha.

15 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo, Mr. Silva. Is
16 there anyone else who would like to comment on the EIS
17 at this time? If not, I'd like to call up Colonel
18 Killian to give some closing remarks.

19 COLONEL KILLIAN: Well, I don't know what to say
20 after Uncle Albert got up and shared that with us. I
21 know how difficult it was for everybody here over the
22 course of this entire week, actually over the course of
23 the last 30 years, to deal with this complicated issue.

24 As I started out this evening tonight's not the
25 last you will have an opportunity to engage with your

T64-1

Responses

1 Army. We are here and we would like to hear from you.
2 You have at least until the 21st of September and, as I
3 said, we will consider an extension.

4 But we would like to point out there are many
5 people in the audience tonight that are subject matter
6 experts, at least we consider them so, who would love to
7 be able to share with you, to learn from you and to work
8 with you to try to achieve some sort of balance within
9 the valley so that you can continue to practice in a
10 traditional way while we also have the responsibility of
11 training our young men and women as they get ready to
12 deploy to the global war on terrorism.

13 Again there are many, many different ways for
14 you to share. Makuaeis.com continues to be up if you
15 have Internet access. We will do everything in our
16 power to try to be able to capture all these issues.

17 As I've said in other meetings the transcription
18 will be posted on the web. We can provide that to you,
19 but what we'd really like to do is make sure that we've
20 accurately captured what was said. And so if you have
21 the opportunity, please, please, do a proofread on what
22 your testimony was so that we've got it right.

23 Again, it's been a long week. I appreciate
24 everybody, I know how hard it is to get up here and what
25 courage it takes to speak from the heart. Thank you

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

1 very much.

2 FACILITATOR GOMES: With that we'd like to thank
3 everyone, especially the people from the community,
4 Waianae community, for hosting everybody. And thank you
5 all for coming out. Mahalo.

6 Aunty Frenchy's asking and just reminded me that
7 protocol calls for a closing pule.

8 (Closing pule given by Albert Silva.)

9 (Proceedings concluded at 6:15 p.m.)

10 ---00---

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Comments

Responses

115

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, MADELINE B. GABLE, Certified Shorthand Reporter for the State of Hawaii, and JAMIE MIYATA, Certified Shorthand Reporter, do hereby certify:

That we were acting as shorthand reporters in the foregoing matter on the 27th day of August, 2005.

That the proceedings were taken down in computerized machine shorthand by us and were thereafter reduced to print under our supervision; that the foregoing represents, to the best of our ability, a correct transcript of the proceedings had in the foregoing matter.

Each of us further certify that we are not counsel for any of the parties hereto, nor in any way interested in the outcome of the cause named in the caption.

Dated: September 7, 2005.


MADELINE B. GABLE
Certified Shorthand Reporter #210


JAMIE MIYATA
Certified Shorthand Reporter

This page intentionally left blank.