

**TRANSCRIPTS**



**Comments**

**Responses**

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23

In Re: )  
 )  
MAKUA MILITARY RESERVATION )  
DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT )  
STATEMENT PUBLIC COMMENT )  
MEETING )  
 )

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

The above matter came on for public comment meeting on behalf of the 25th Infantry Division (Light) and the U.S. Army Hawaii at Waianae District Park, 85-601 Farrington Highway, Waianae, Hawaii, commencing at 6:52 p.m., on Tuesday, August 23, 2005.

REPORTED BY: ADRIANNE IGE KURASAKI, RPR, CSR 388  
CAROL E.M. SUGIYAMA, RPR, CSR 295

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
Suite 1470, Makai Tower  
733 Bishop Street  
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813  
(808)524-7778

**Comments**

2

**Responses**

1

2 U.S. ARMY DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT  
3 MEETING STAFF LIST

3

4 PANEL:

5 Colonel Howard Killian, Garrison Commander  
6 Colonel Timothy J. Pendolino, Staff Judge Advocate

6

7

8 FACILITATORS:  
9 ANNELLE AMARAL  
10 KUUMEA ALOHA GOMES

9

10

11 HAWAIIAN-ENGLISH TRANSLATOR:  
12 IOKEPA BADIS

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

**Comments**

3

**Responses**

1	INDEX	
2		PAGE
3	OPENING PULE:	
	Oli Kahea by Malama Makua	4
4	Response by Iokepa Badis	4
5		
6	WELCOMING REMARKS:	
	Annelle Amaral	4
7	Colonel Howard Killian	4
8		
9	PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:	
10	Adelaide "Frenchy" DeSoto	13
	Bill Prescott	17
11	William Aila	21
	Kaui Amsterdam	28
12	Melva Aila	34
	Pat Patterson	36
13	Dr. Fred Dodge	38
	Doreen Redford	42
14	Mike Pettingill	45
	Vince Dodge	50
15	David Henkin	55
	Ikaika Hussey	74
16	Dr. Marian Hussey	77
	Kyle Kajihiro	80
17	Sparky Rodrigues	86
	Lika Jordan	90
18	Kit Glover	92
	Sebastian Collier	96
19	Dorothy Soo-Kiu Lam	96
	Leandra Wai	101
20	David Henkin (continued)	104
21		
22	CLOSING REMARKS:	
	Annelle Amaral	108
23	Colonel Killian	108
24		
25		

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

Comments

4

Responses

1 Tuesday, August 23, 2005 6:52 p.m.  
2 PROCEEDINGS  
3 (Oli Kahea by Malama Makua)  
4 (Response by Iokepa Badis)  
5 (Opening Pule)  
6 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Thank you very much for that  
7 beautiful pule. We welcome everyone here this evening.  
8 Before we begin, I think it's important also to  
9 introduce some of the people that are gathered here. The  
10 people that unfortunately have to sit at the front table  
11 and face all of us, need to be introduced. And I would  
12 like to say first, one of them is Colonel Pendolino, who  
13 is furthest away from me. He is the Staff Judge Advocate  
14 with the U.S. Army.  
15 With him also is someone that many of you already  
16 know, and that's Colonel Howard Killian. As you know,  
17 Colonel Killian is a Garrison Commander for the 25th  
18 Light Infantry Division. And I'd like invite Colonel  
19 Killian to come up and say a few words of welcome.  
20 Colonel.  
21 COLONEL KILLIAN: Aloha.  
22 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Aloha.  
23 COLONEL KILLIAN: I want to thank everybody for  
24 coming out tonight. Tonight starts our first public  
25 comment meeting, which is proscribed under the National  
  
PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

**Comments**

5

1 Environmental Policy Act. Many of you already  
2 participated in this information-sharing process. We had  
3 three meetings during the month of July. And tonight kind  
4 of signals the first of three meetings that we will do  
5 this week. And we will do a follow-on meeting Thursday  
6 evening in Nanakuli, and then we will do another meeting  
7 here Saturday evening -- Saturday afternoon.

8 But this is not your only opportunity to share  
9 with us your concerns and issues as it relates to Makua.  
10 There are a number of other different ways. We take  
11 written testimony. There will be people here who can  
12 assist you in sharing. We've got a Web site called  
13 makuaeis.com for those of you who have Internet access and  
14 would like to do it that way.

15 We will continue this process through the month of  
16 September and, again, try to be comprehensive in our  
17 approach to getting as much testimony as we possibly can.

18 Our goal here is exactly what the law was written  
19 for, and that is community engagement. So everything you  
20 can share with us will be gone through a process in trying  
21 to collate that information into issues that we can then  
22 turn around into actionable items and will find their way  
23 into the final EIS, which will be kind of the culmination  
24 of the staff work that comes out of this engagement  
25 process.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

**Responses**

Comments

6

1           As I've said in the past, this is just a meeting  
2 we schedule. If anybody has an opportunity or would like  
3 anyone from my staff or the Army to come and speak with  
4 them either one on one or in a different forum, we would  
5 be -- we would be happy to entertain that request and try  
6 to get out to see you.

7           So tonight kind of kicks it off. Don't be  
8 bashful. As I said, we did at least three meetings  
9 already, so you've heard me talk. I'm done talking. Now  
10 it's time for me to listen. And I will give you my  
11 attention here to the best of my ability, but we have a  
12 number of other folks here who also will be taking notes,  
13 all in an effort to try to make sure that we accurately  
14 get your concern or issue.

15           Additionally, this will be transcribed. We will  
16 post the actual transcribed minutes to this to the Web  
17 site. So if you're interested and you want to make sure  
18 that we accurately got what you're trying to get across to  
19 us, we'll give you the opportunity to review those and  
20 then make corrections later on.

21           Additionally, you can see it's being filmed by  
22 several different cameras. And so there will be an  
23 opportunity also to see some sort of video piece to this,  
24 should you want to do that as well.

25           So the last thing I will say is, tonight's the

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

Responses

**Comments**

7

1 first night. We've got two more events to go through like  
2 this. If there's something that we're not doing tonight  
3 that you think should happen, just from the way we're set  
4 up and the way we're operating here, please let us know so  
5 that by Thursday night we can make the corrections and  
6 have a better meeting. Thank you.

7 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo. Thank you. Thank  
8 you, Colonel Killian.

9 Okay. In case I didn't introduce myself, aloha,  
10 my name is Annelle Amaral. I am your facilitator. And  
11 facilitating with me also this evening is Kuomea Aloha  
12 Gomes. So she and I will switch off this evening  
13 throughout the night.

14 Some housekeeping stuff: As you know, the  
15 bathrooms are here to the rear should you have the need  
16 for that. And the punch and cookies are always available  
17 and we'll keep making our way down so that the meeting  
18 will be easier to take.

19 So tonight is, as Colonel has said, the first of  
20 three meetings to invite public comment on the Draft  
21 Environmental Impact Statement for the Military Training  
22 Activities at Makua Military Reservation. The meetings  
23 consist of an open house, during which informal materials  
24 on the project can be viewed and questions can be asked,  
25 followed by a public comment period. The meetings take

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

**Responses**

## Comments

8

1 place after this one on Thursday, August 25th at  
2 Nanaikapono Elementary School. 5:30 to 6:45 being the  
3 open house. 7:00 to 10:00 being the public comment  
4 period. And then Saturday, August 27th, back here at  
5 Waianae District Park. 12:30 to 1:45 being the open  
6 house. 2:00 to 6:00 p.m. being the public comment period.  
7 The public comment period is a very structured  
8 thing. It is one-way communication. And basically,  
9 testimony is taken here at the podium. If you're unable  
10 to make your way here, we also have a handheld mic. We  
11 can come to you in the audience and move the cameras  
12 around for that.

13 But testimony is taken at the microphone because  
14 the stenographers are taking verbatim transcript of what  
15 is being said this evening. The videographer is  
16 maintaining, then, a video and audio recording of what is  
17 taking place, both of which then become part of the public  
18 record.

19 Should you have questions that you need answered,  
20 you're going to find it very frustrating because the  
21 colonels are unable to answer the questions. This is  
22 one-way communication. The dialogue has taken place  
23 earlier so this is a monologue. It goes into the record.  
24 Your questions will be noted. And if a response can be  
25 done, then I imagine that response would be given but you

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

**Responses**

1 will not hear a response this evening.

2           For those who are not comfortable about coming to  
3 the microphone and speaking, another stenographer will be  
4 located in this room just behind the community displays  
5 and will be available to take, again, your comment on  
6 record in that setting, away from this eye -- the view of  
7 everyone. So if you're more comfortable doing that or you  
8 don't want to stay, you want to leave early, that  
9 accommodation is also made for you. And all you have to  
10 do is go to one of the people at the sign-in table and  
11 tell them that you need to have this other accommodation,  
12 and a stenographer will be made available for you.

13           As a result of the recordings by the court  
14 reporter and the videographer, we ask that you keep all  
15 sort of side conversations to a minimum. If you must have  
16 a discussion with someone, we would request that you take  
17 it outside the room. It's very difficult for these people  
18 operating this equipment to hear what's being said if it's  
19 interrupted with this mutter of other conversation.

20           We ask also that if you have cell phones or  
21 pagers, that you put it on vibrate or silence so that,  
22 again, the recordings are not interrupted or undermined in  
23 any way.

24           This evening, as in all the meetings for public  
25 comment, a translator for Olelo Hawaii is provided for

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Comments

11

1 comes in. All comments is weighted equally.

2           The process is such that when you came in, you  
3 signed up indicating you wanted to speak. Little cards  
4 are then given to me in the order in which you signed up.  
5 And so you will be called in that order. Those of you  
6 sitting in the audience didn't sign up to speak but now  
7 are inspired to do so, by all means, go ahead and speak.  
8 Go on back to the table, give them your name. They'll  
9 bring it up to us. We will call you in the order that we  
10 have been given.

11           The role of the facilitators this evening, quite  
12 frankly, is simply to monitor testimony for time and for  
13 conduct. If we have a lot of testifiers -- and it doesn't  
14 look like we have a lot this evening. But if we have a  
15 lot, then we kind of have to ask you to limit your  
16 testimony. So sometimes we interrupt you by saying, can  
17 you please summarize, can you please end. That's when we  
18 usually are very annoying to you. Don't take it  
19 personally. We're not trying to cut you off, but we are  
20 trying to cut you off.

21           The other thing facilitators monitor for is just  
22 kind of appropriate conduct. We assume, because we love  
23 one another, that we treat everybody up here with respect  
24 regardless of whether they're saying something we don't  
25 agree with. So when the people here are testifying, we

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

**Comments**

10

1 people who wish to olelo makuahine. And I'd like to bring  
2 up Iokepa -- and I don't know where he is. There he is --  
3 to say a few words about that.

4 Aloha.

5 TRANSLATOR IOKEPA: Aloha kakou.

6 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Aloha.

7 TRANSLATOR IOKEPA: Tonight, I'll be translating  
8 for anybody who wishes to use the olelo makuahine,  
9 Hawaiian language, tonight. If you do decide to use the  
10 language, please come and see me. And as I'm translating,  
11 I'd request that you do line by line. And I'll probably  
12 tap you or pause you, and then I can translate for you.  
13 So we get your guys' point across.

14 (Speaking Hawaiian.)

15 FACILITATOR AMARAL: The comment period remains  
16 open until September 21st, so the record is still kept  
17 open for further comment. Comments may be submitted  
18 either through e-mail, snail mail, fax. Forms can be  
19 found again at the entrance at that sign-in table or you  
20 can see Mr. Gary Shirakata, who is at the back of the  
21 room. If you need more information about that, Gary is  
22 with the Army Corps of Engineers and is sort of  
23 coordinating this.

24 All comment, regardless of how it is submitted, is  
25 given equal weight. So it doesn't matter the form that it

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

**Responses**

**Comments**

12

1 give them our full attention and we act in a respectful  
2 way. And everyone that comes here is allowed this sort of  
3 neutral zone to be heard, to be recorded, to be  
4 considered. So that's another thing that the facilitators  
5 monitor for, is just conduct and respect.

6 Beyond that, I think the only other thing you're  
7 going to see us interfere with is like on the hour, if we  
8 can, we will probably stop and take a break. The break is  
9 in part because the guy with the camera has to change his  
10 tape. The other reason for the break is that the  
11 stenographers need to spell one another and so we take a  
12 break for that. And then our facilitators are going to  
13 switch off, too. 'Cause after a while, you get annoyed  
14 just hearing one facilitator interrupt you, so then we  
15 just share that task.

16 Okay. Reminder: Forms in the back of the room  
17 for public comment. If you wish to take this home, write  
18 down a comment and mail it in. These are available to  
19 you. And then kind of a nice little brochure summarizing  
20 the project and all the pertinent addresses for comment  
21 are on the back of it. So we would invite you to take  
22 those things home.

23 We shall now begin. The first speaker will be the  
24 former trustee of the Office of Hawaiian Affairs, the  
25 founder of the Office of Hawaiian Affairs, Aunty Frenchy

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

**Responses**

**Comments**

13

1 DeSoto. The second speaker is Mr. Bill Prescott.  
 2 So, Auntie Frenchy, we'd love to call you up to  
 3 come and speak. Aloha.  
 4 MS. DeSOTO: Thank you very much. Mahalo.  
 5 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo.  
 6 MS. DeSOTO: Aloha no. Ko'u inoa,  
 7 Keanuenuokalaninuiamamau Hanau mua na wahine Kahikilani  
 8 Kakae Kaaipuaa Kahikilani na Keiki o Halauwai Kaluakini a  
 9 me John Kakae Kaaipuaa Halauwai kaluakini ke Hua ke Oahu a  
 10 me Lilia Pohe ke Oahu ke Keiki a Kahoeakahoe a me Nalepo Na  
 11 Iwi o na Kupuna noho na papa o Molokai, Na moku aina o na  
 12 wahine kapu, Na papa o Maui. Na Ahupuaa o Ewa, Waianae na  
 13 aina o Kanaloa Pau mai ka makani Kaiaulu, Kaena, Hoala, ka  
 14 lihau anuhea o Makua, o Ka haaheo no ia o na Kupuna  
 15 Halapa, e Kupuna. Amama ua noa, lele wale aku la.  
 16 This is who I am. Nothing more. Nothing less.  
 17 Before my kupuna and I -- and they are here this evening  
 18 with me -- are the difficult and overwhelming hoops you  
 19 have designed for us to jump through. I believe you call  
 20 this exercise gathering public comment and input towards  
 21 your 50-pound EIS, which costs literally millions of  
 22 dollars to prepare and produce. The Waianae community,  
 23 with its poorest per capita income, must respond the best  
 24 way we know how to, or forever hamau.  
 T1-1 | 25 This EIS was never intended for our poe aloha to

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T1-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

**Comments**

14

T1-1 | 1 understand, but is a typical manipulation by your  
 2 government to achieve its desired result, the continued  
 3 use of Makua. Regardless of the promise you made 50 years  
 4 ago to return Makua Valley. It was never intended, the  
 5 EIS, for lay people to understand. The limited time frame  
 6 to review makes it impossible -- impossible -- for us to  
 T1-2 | 7 review. We do not have staff to help us. We need more  
 8 time to review this EIS.  
 9 Your promise to me was that I could comment on the  
 10 cultural section. In doing so, you led me to believe that  
 11 when you talk about my culture, you actually know what the  
 12 heck you're talking about. While you continue to promote  
 13 yourselves as good stewards of Makua, fires flare up for  
 14 no apparent reason, no keaka, consuming our community's  
 15 trust so that you can accomplish what you proposed to  
 16 while mitigating damage to the integrity of my culture,  
 17 Makua Valley. You have failed and will continue to fail  
 18 to convince us.  
 19 If your activities set fire to Makua during  
 T1-3 | 20 periods of routine maintenance, how can we trust you -- my  
 21 God -- to protect Makua as you propose much higher rates  
 22 of training, with tracers, tow missiles, and that you  
 23 admit will cause or may cause more fires. Your  
 T1-4 | 24 understanding of Hawaiian culture focuses on the piles of  
 25 rocks and what the past Hawaiians did at Makua. It

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T1-2

The Army provided funds to Malama Makua (through Earthjustice) for technical assistants to assist Malama Makua and other members of the Waianae Coast community in understanding the issues involved during the EIS process to facilitate and inform public participation and comment in the NEPA process. Further, the Army extended the public review period from 60 days to 75 days. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

T1-3

While fire may pose a threat to the environment, the Army is adopting and continuously updating its Integrated Wildland Fire Management Plan, as well as the Army's fire suppression infrastructure, to address the fire threat from these new sources. The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T1-4

In Sections 4.9 and 4.10 of the Draft EIS, the Army assessed impacts to all natural and cultural resources consistent with NEPA, the National Historic Preservation Act, and the Endangered Species Act. The Army has also assessed the historical and anticipated impacts to water resources in Sections 3.7, 4.7, and 5.3.7.

**Comments**

15

T1-4 1 ignores the mo'olelo, the sources of fresh water, the  
 2 relationship that Hawaiians have with the aina, certainly  
 3 their kuleana. It further ignores and in its ignorance  
 T1-5 4 fails to recognize that Hawaiian culture is alive and  
 5 exists today in Makua and will exist in Makua into the  
 6 future.  
 T1-6 7 The EIS fails to acknowledge this, and in doing so  
 8 continues to fail to adequately address the impacts, not  
 9 only on the culture sites, but on the culture itself.  
 10 Auwe. Nui kahewa.  
 11 The other slap to our face is your acknowledgment  
 12 that our culture will continue to be adversely impacted.  
 13 However, we have now a dance called mitigation, created by  
 14 the very people creating the damage.  
 15 I was told, you know, when I was young, by my  
 16 English teacher that when things began to taste bitter,  
 17 keep swallowing; after a while, they don't taste too bad.  
 18 This will never go away, this taste. All of this, I am  
 19 told, so you can protect my ohana and I? Does your  
 20 proposed training protect us from the affluent, who dump  
 21 their garbage at our front door and call it Waimanalo  
 22 Gulch Landfill? Will your training protect us from the  
 23 effects of burning high-sulfur fuel in order to generate  
 24 electricity at Kahe Power Plant for the greater  
 25 population?

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T1-5  
 Please see the response to Comment T1-4.

T1-6  
 The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate. Moreover, while impacts to the culture itself cannot be reasonably assessed in the EIS, the effects on contributors to that culture, including mana and access to cultural sites, has been assessed. Please see Chapters 3, 4, and 5 of the Draft EIS.

**Comments**

16

1 Oh, yeah. Poi nah kala mai. Commercial waste.  
 2 Hazardous as it is, the dumping continues in the middle of  
 3 a Hawaiian community. Leukemia runs disproportionately  
 4 higher on the Waianae Coast than anywhere else. Don't  
 5 forget Lualualei Naval Towers with 1 million watts  
 6 transmission power with a radius of two and a half miles  
 7 EM radiation. But you see, majority of the population in  
 8 Waianae is 55.5 percent Hawaiian. Racism? Nah. Mohai,  
 9 all.

T1-7

10 One would think that with both ends of our  
 11 community under siege, there would be protection provided  
 12 to our community. Clearly, it was the question in my  
 13 daughter's eyes that said why? How come? As she battled  
 14 leukemia. There was no evidence or was there anybody who  
 15 walked forward and said we will mitigate this as we  
 16 lowered her casket into the ground.

17 This very scenario has been played out in hundreds  
 18 of homes here in Waianae. What other communities have  
 19 been forced to live with the hewa? Anywhere else in  
 20 Amelika?

21 Federal environmental laws offer Hawaiians no  
 22 protection. We kanaka maoli have survived the scourge of  
 23 the Pakaemai. Now you bring us more danger and pollution.

T1-8

24 Stryker conveys filled with ammunition passing on our  
 25 highways, dangerously -- oh so dangerously close to our

T1-9

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T1-7

The Draft EIS identified long-term, cumulative environmental justice impacts on the Waianae community in Sections 4.12 and 5.3.12. Moreover, the EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T1-8

The Draft EIS identified impacts to air quality, soils, and water resources resulting from the proposed action in Chapter 4. In addition, the EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T1-9

The Army's methods for transport of ammunitions are described in Section 3.6, which takes into consideration schools near Farrington Highway.

Comments

17

1 schools that are filled with mostly Hawaiian children.  
2 Oh, what the hell. What's a few more Hawaiians? Mahalo.  
3 Kala.  
4 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo.  
5 Okay. Our next speaker is Mr. Bill Prescott.  
6 He's followed by William Aila.  
7 Aloha, Mr. Prescott.  
8 MR. PRESCOTT: Before I begin, people are always  
9 confused about my last name. They think I'm a haole and  
10 what am I doing talking about Hawaiian issues. So I want  
11 you to know that I am a native Hawaiian. I'm a lessee on  
12 Hawaiian Homelands.  
13 You know, back in the old days when Queen  
14 Liliuokalani and Bernice Pauahi, they married rich haoles,  
15 you know. My mother picked a guy who was good looking.  
16 He didn't have any money.  
17 So let me begin, and I want to start by saying  
18 Colonel Killman (sic), members of the EIS staff, as a  
19 native Hawaiian, I want to commend you for a great job in  
20 putting together this report. It represents the  
21 tremendous effort by the Army to care for the land while  
22 preparing our soldiers, many of them from Hawaii, for  
23 combat. The only part of the report that has some concern  
24 for us is in the section on Cultural Resources where  
25 inferences on our Hawaiian culture are based on oral

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

Responses

**Comments**

18

1 testimony.

2 I would like to comment on a couple of them. What  
 3 I'm about to present is documented, and I'll provide the  
 4 references to anyone interested when I'm through. And  
 5 I'll try to be as brief as I can.

T2-1

6 First, to the inference that the Makua Military  
 7 Reservation, the MMR, is on sacred land. I can tell you  
 8 that our ancient ancestors believed that all lands, to  
 9 include sea and the air were all sacred. Why? Because  
 10 they were taught that the gods created them and therefore  
 11 belonged to the gods. That's what made it sacred. Hence,  
 12 there was no private ownership of land.

T2-2

13 Secondly, to the inference that there is mana on  
 14 the MMR. Mana, which is spiritual power that's given by  
 15 the Hawaiian gods. Again, I can tell you that our  
 16 ancestors believed that mana existed almost everywhere, in  
 17 people, in plants, in animals and, yes, even rocks, but in  
 18 varying degrees. For example, those who are talented,  
 19 skillful, knowledgeable, had more mana than the average  
 20 individual. Kahunas, even more than them. And our  
 21 chiefs, who were considered descendents of the gods had an  
 22 enormous amount of spiritual power.

23 However, these beliefs all ended in 1819 when  
 24 Kamehameha II, purposely violated one of the most sacred  
 25 of kapus by sitting down and eating with his mother and

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T2-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

T2-2

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

## Comments

19

1 some other women. This was a forbidden act, punishable by  
2 death. When the gods didn't punish him, the whole kapu  
3 system was overthrown. Queen Keopuolani declared -- and  
4 she was the mother of Kamehameha II -- declared our gods  
5 have done us no good; they are cruel.

6 The chief kahuna that day, Hewahewa, stated, "My  
7 thoughts have always been that there is only one God, one  
8 great God dwelling in the heavens."

9 To effectively put an end to the Hawaiian  
10 religion, to mana, and all that was sacred, then  
T2-2 11 Kamehameha II ordered all the heiaus, sacred places of  
12 worship, sacred temples, to be demolished on all of the  
13 islands, god idols to be taken down and burned.

14 What this did, in effect, was to free the Hawaiian  
15 people to be able to eat with their families, with  
16 whomever they chose. Women, who were forbidden to eat  
17 certain foods, now were able to eat whatever they chose.  
18 They were able to plant whatever they chose, to fish for  
19 whatever, and the list goes on and on, without fear or  
20 punishment.

21 The kauwas, the lowest level, these people were  
22 the untouchables. Whenever they needed a sacrifice to the  
23 gods, that's where they got 'em from. They were free.  
24 All of the Hawaiians were free from this bondage to the  
25 kapus.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

**Comments**

20

1           And let me add, no succeeding ruler --  
 2 Kamehameha III, IV, V, Kalaukaua, Queen Liliuokalani, who  
 3 by the way was a staunch Christian -- ever restored the  
 4 Hawaiian religion.

5           In 1820, the Christians arrived. Our ancestors  
 6 were drawn to this God, a God of love and forgiveness, a  
 7 God that believed human life, of being created in the  
 8 image and likeness of God, was sacred. So you see, it's  
 9 human life that is sacred on the MMR.

T2-3

10           So based on the information I've provided, we who  
 11 support our military -- the Veterans of Foreign Wars, the  
 12 American Legion, Supporters of Training in the MMR,  
 13 military service member families, and the silent  
 14 majority -- strongly recommend that the MMR be utilized as  
 15 necessary to insure our soldiers are effectively prepared  
 16 for combat and that their preparedness takes priority over  
 17 any plant, animal, or cultural consideration.

18           To those who oppose our military, I remind you  
 19 they are not here by choice. They're here because our  
 20 congressmen, whom we elected, put them here.

21           Thank you for listening. Mahalo.

22           FACILITATOR AMARAL: Thank you very much,  
 23 Mr. Prescott.

24           The next speaker is William Aila, followed by Kauai  
 25 Amsterdam.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T2-3

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

Comments

21

1 Aloha.

2 MR. AILA: Aloha ahiahi, everyone, tonight. Bill.

3 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Aloha.

4 MR. AILA: Before I begin my formal testimony, I'd

5 just like to thank the previous speaker for his

6 revisionist history of Hawaii. Thank you, Bill.

7 We agree on a couple of things. We agree that

8 they don't need to be here; that they're here just because

9 of our congressional delegation, which I did not vote for.

10 I also would like to thank you for confirming that

11 manifest destiny is alive and well in the 21st century

12 and being proposed even here in Hawaii by our own people,

13 the many Hawaiians who fought on battles on epic on

14 Molokai, on Hawaii island, on Maui, when the kapus were

15 supposedly overthrown and continue today to honor those

16 kapus. So it's a very bad statement to say that it all

17 went away. I have kapus that I still continue to do today

18 as a fisherman. So I'm living proof. Just so that all of

19 you see, I'm living proof that that hasn't gone away.

20 Kaumualii, my great grandmother, taught me, the

21 first fish I catch goes to Kaumualii. So every time I go

22 holo holo, the first fish I catch, guess what, goes to

23 Kaumualii. So Queen Kaahumanu and the folks that you

24 represented didn't change my culture. It's alive. It's

25 being -- it's being protected. It's being preserved and

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

Responses

## Comments

22

1 it's being promoted today.

2           When I take my grandchildren fishing, guess what,  
3 the first fish they catch, Kaumualii. So please don't  
4 believe that Hawaiian culture went out in 1819, 'cause  
5 that is not the case. I'm living proof of that. And  
6 there are many others out there that are living proof of  
7 that. I'm so glad that you made this wonderful example  
8 because I've been trying to get Lori to understand, I've  
9 been trying to get Colonel Killian to understand that one  
10 of the ways to destroy mana -- and I'm glad you talked  
11 about mana in the rocks.

12           One of the ways to destroy mana is to burn. And  
13 that's precisely what those Hawaiians who wanted to do  
14 away with the mana that were in the idols did. They burnt  
15 it to destroy the mana. And every time there's a fire at  
16 Makua, on purpose or inadvertently, it destroys the mana  
17 of those sites. So just because the rocks didn't fall  
18 down, the mana in those rocks have been diminished. And  
19 you can smile and you can laugh, but that's the truth as  
20 many of us see it. And you're entitled to have your  
21 opinion. So thank you very much for sharing with us some  
22 of the incorrect things that some people believe.

23           On to the formal portion. Right off the bat, I  
24 got to say, 60 days is not enough. I read the entire DEA.  
25 It took me more than six days to do that. I haven't read

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

T3-1

The Draft EIS addresses impacts from the proposed action to cultural resources in Sections 3.10 and 4.10.

T3-2

The Army extended the public review period from 60 days to 75 days. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

## Comments

23

1 the entire EIS because it's 30 percent more voluminous  
 2 than that. So somehow, you need to make some sort of  
 3 arrangements, some sort of concession, that 60 days is not  
 4 enough to review this document.

5 This document fails to comply with NEPA and with  
 6 the settlement agreement. In Chapters 1 and 2, describing  
 7 its need, its purpose and scope, and its description of  
 8 the proposed action and alternatives, the document fails  
 9 to disclose that within Army Reg. 350-11, the Commander of  
 10 the U.S. Army Pacific has the discretion -- and I'm going  
 11 to use this word several times tonight -- the discretion  
 12 to determine what qualifies as certified training.

13 So we are presented in this EIS a list of  
 14 alternatives, but they don't tell you that in that list of  
 15 alternatives or within those five alternatives or four  
 16 alternatives or three alternatives that the commanding  
 17 general of the Pacific has the discretion to say, well,  
 18 you know what, maybe one time per company is enough. So  
 19 you never will hear that discussed in the alternatives  
 20 that the Army puts forth, because the Army doesn't want  
 21 you to understand that. It's not in their benefit to tell  
 22 you all of the alternatives. 'Cause if we knew that one  
 23 of the alternatives was perhaps within the power of the  
 24 general of the -- commander of the Pacific that only one  
 25 time per company is enough to qualify as training, then

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

## Responses

T3-3

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate. Use of MMR as described in the Draft EIS, moreover, is structured around operating MMR as a training range available to different military groups for a variety of training activities. Use of MMR, as well as the level of activities, were not the only factors considered in developing the alternatives. The EIS was prepared in accordance with the 2001 Settlement Agreement.

T3-4

Please see response to Comment T1-3.

**Comments**

24

T3-4 1 perhaps there would be other alternatives that are being  
 2 proposed. So we don't know that because you're not told  
 3 that. So right off the bat, the EIS is flawed.

T3-5 4 If we don't know what the level of discretion is,  
 5 if we aren't provided with the correct analysis, how can  
 6 we be expected to provide intelligent comment? If we  
 7 cannot provide relevant comment on this EIS, on this  
 8 process, then I repeat it, the process is flawed and it  
 9 fails.

T3-6 10 Another example of nondisclosure is within the  
 11 analysis that the Army uses to derive the alternatives  
 12 that are before you. You don't see a budgetary or you  
 13 don't see a monetary analysis of all of those alternatives  
 14 or all the other alternatives. So, for example, when they  
 15 say it's cost prohibitive to train at Schofield, you don't  
 16 know whether the cost prohibitive was \$1 more than  
 17 training someplace else or a hundred dollars more than  
 18 training someplace else.

T3-5 19 Again, the process is skewed so that they don't  
 20 have to tell you all the facts so that you can come up  
 21 with intelligent comment, so that the process can be open,  
 22 and deliberated and debated in open fashion. This EIS in  
 23 this form, this draft, doesn't tell you that. So how do I  
 24 know that the preferred alternative isn't to rule out  
 25 training at Makua? The analysis isn't proven to me. It's

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T3-5

The Draft EIS described the intended activities to be implemented as part of the training alternatives, which provides an adequate basis for commenting on those alternatives and the analysis of the environmental impacts resulting from those alternatives. The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T3-6

The EIS considered other alternatives in Section 2.5. The EIS now includes evaluation of an alternative in which training proposed for MMR would be conducted at the Pohakuloa Training Area, island of Hawaii (See Chapter 2 for a description of this alternative). This alternative was added in response to public comments received on the Draft EIS. Use of MMR, however, remains the preferred alternative.

**Comments**

25

1 given to me in terms of money. My money, by the way,  
 2 because the federal government takes out those taxes.  
 3 Your money, by the way, because those taxes are taken out  
 4 from you.

T3-7

5 The EIS further ignores agreements that it made in  
 6 the settlement agreement with Malama Makua. It has failed  
 7 to complete all of the surface archaeological surveys  
 8 within the CCAAC training area. It has failed to complete  
 9 any of the subsurface testing for archaeological sites in  
 10 the CCAAC area. It has failed to complete all of the  
 11 surface archaeological surveys in the surface danger  
 12 zones. Failed, failed, failed. When it comes to  
 13 archaeology, it has failed to identify the universe of  
 14 archaeological sites.

T3-8

15 It has failed to clear -- another settlement  
 16 agreement. It has failed to clear the unexploded  
 17 ordnances from a thousand meters mauka of Farrington  
 18 Highway, thereby resulting in an incomplete archaeological  
 19 survey, not only of the CCAAC, but of Makua, Kahanahaiki,  
 20 and Koiahi.

T3-7

21 The results of these failures is an incomplete  
 22 survey, not only of the CCAAC, not only of the surface  
 23 danger zones, but of all of those valleys. The  
 24 implication is that the Army wants us to comment on  
 25 potential impacts to cultural sites even though they know

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T3-7

Surface surveys have been completed for the entire area within the south firebreak road except for those areas containing improved conventional munitions. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the majority of the surface danger zone of the 105mm round. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the Ukanipo Heiau complex, Koiahi Gulch and almost all of Kahanahaiki Valley. This coverage is reflected in Figures 3-24 and 3-25 in the Draft EIS.

Subsurface testing has been undertaken in Sites 4243, 4244, 4245 and 4246. This testing showed there is a subsurface component to these sites; however, this limited testing resulted in protests from two Native Hawaiians due to the invasive and destructive nature of the testing.

An additional subsurface archaeological survey was conducted in November and December of 2006. The results of this survey have been incorporated into Section 3.10, and the survey report is included as Appendix G-9.

T3-8

The Army is continuing with its plans to clear this area, subject to safety requirements, USFWS consultation, and other restrictions. The clearance of the ordnance within 1000 meters of Farrington Highway is not related to the completion of the archaeological surveys.

## Comments

26

1 and are well aware of and understand that the surveys are  
2 incomplete.

3 Let me put it in layman terms for you, an  
4 illustration is this: An insurance adjuster comes to your  
5 house. He looks at two of the bedrooms in your  
6 five-bedroom house. Then he tells you, hey, we're going  
7 to do some damage to your house but we're not going to  
8 tell you exactly what the damage is going to be. And by  
9 the way, we want you to comment on what the total damage  
10 to the house is going to be.

11 I can't believe that this is the kind of study --  
12 I can't believe that this kind of study complies with  
13 NEPA. It certainly fails to comply with NEPA, the  
14 settlement agreement, any kind of moral authority that  
15 they derive from in trying to make these assessments.

16 And finally, on this proclamation about readiness  
17 is tempered by recent history. From 1998 to 2001, there  
18 was no training at Makua, and all of the soldiers were  
19 declared certified and ready. From 2001 to 2004, the Army  
20 was allotted 37 CCAAC training events per the settlement  
21 agreement. It conducted only 26, with several of the  
22 training being company-combined assault -- excuse me,  
23 being convoy training. So they didn't even use them up --  
24 all of them up, and in fact used them for other training.  
25 But once again, the Army certified that all of those units

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

T3-3

**Comments**

27

T3-9

1 were certified and ready to go. So for six years, at  
 2 least, the value was not used at the level that the Army  
 3 said it needed to use it in order to be certified and  
 4 ready. In each case and in each year, the Army continued  
 5 to certify that its soldiers were certified and ready to  
 6 go.

T3-3

7 That indicates a lot of discretion -- there's that  
 8 word again, discretion -- in determining the level of  
 9 certification. And this discretion goes back to the  
 10 commanding general of the Pacific.

11 So if they don't tell you all the facts, all the  
 12 discretion at their disposal, and they want you to comment  
 13 on a report that's three telephone books thick, the  
 14 process fails. There's no other way to say it. If they  
 15 don't give you all the tools that you need to make an  
 16 intelligent decision with regards to how a valley in your  
 17 backyard is going to be impacted and how your cultural  
 18 sites, your connection to the past and your connection to  
 19 the future, your children, because they got to know about  
 20 who they came from, where they came from in order to know  
 21 where they're going, if all of those things are not  
 22 presented to you in an intelligent way and in an objective  
 23 way, the process, the NEPA process, the settlement  
 24 process, the moral process fails.

25 My recommendation to the Army, Colonel Killian --

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T3-9

Training requirements are constantly changing based on lessons learned in combat, training events, new equipment, and new commanders. Using historical data to assess future needs is faulty logic. Times of war, such as now, drastically change training requirements. While units have been assessed in the past as ready for combat without conducting live-fire training exercises at MMR, the Army was forced to undertake training work-arounds to include training at locations outside of the state of Hawaii. These work arounds were both time consuming and costly. Additionally, the lack of home-based live-fire training capability has an impact on Soldier morale as more time is spent away from family, which is not quantifiable in Unit Status Reports.

**Comments**

28

T3-10

1 and I'm sorry you're the one that has to do this. I like  
 2 you. You have integrity. Personally, you have integrity.  
 3 The people that you work for, on the other hand, I feel,  
 4 do not have integrity. So I'm sorry that you have to sit  
 5 there and defend them. I recommend that you go back,  
 6 complete the studies, comply with the settlement  
 7 agreement, provide the public with information concerning  
 8 the levels of discretion and the budgetary items that went  
 9 into making those alternatives preferred or not preferred.  
 10 Provide us with the information on the levels of  
 11 discretion that the general -- the commanding general of  
 12 the Pacific possesses, provide the necessary financial  
 13 analysis to justify your alternatives before you declare a  
 14 FONSI. Those are my recommendations to you, sir. Thank  
 15 you very much for your time.  
 16 Aloha to you all.  
 17 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo.  
 18 Just a reminder, for those of you who may want to  
 19 testify but not do it here at the podium, a stenographer  
 20 is provided in the room right behind us for you to give  
 21 testimony on the record.  
 22 The next speaker is Kauai Amsterdam, followed by  
 23 Melva Aila.  
 24 Aloha.  
 25 MR. AMSTERDAM: Brothers and sisters of our

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T3-10  
 Please see response to Comment T3-3.

## Comments

29

1 Hawaiian community, family and friends, our military  
2 representatives, and all of our brothers and sisters  
3 gathered here tonight, I say aloha ahiahi.

4 Tonight, as I speak relatively briefly,  
5 acknowledging wonderful speakers that have gone before and  
6 the very important cultural and practical, statistical  
7 features and information that it has been presented to us,  
8 may I also present what I have to say and call upon our  
9 Father in heaven and our Lord Jesus as I speak tonight  
10 that what I say will be in accordance with their spirit  
11 and their mind and will. There are several issues that  
12 are to be addressed, and I would like to speak to at least  
13 two of these issues this night.

14 I represent, actually, the Interim Government of  
15 the Kingdom of Hawaii. I've been acting as prime minister  
16 of the Interim Government of the Kingdom of Hawaii, in  
17 spite of the lack of funding and the disregard that has  
18 been directed to us and other -- others in entities that  
19 have been trying to advance our Kingdom of Hawaii by OHA  
20 with their not recognizing and providing finances, and  
21 also with the Akaka Bill that's coming up that disregards  
22 our true jurisdiction as a government. I mention this,  
23 but in spite of this, we go forth and with the positive  
24 hope of become effective in advancing our government and  
25 our jurisdiction, which cannot actually be achieved

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

## Comments

30

1 sufficiently with the Akaka Bill that is before us now,  
2 because it is insufficient. It doesn't really look at  
3 what we're doing in a serious way as an independent, as a  
4 serious government. I look at it as another minority  
5 program.

6 But notwithstanding, this issue of jurisdiction is  
7 one of the important issues which I raise, because in  
8 addressing this important issue, the military represents  
9 the federal government, an accepted jurisdiction,  
10 authority. And as we speak and as we address this issue,  
11 it's important for us to do it also with acceptable  
12 jurisdiction, and that is the government of the Kingdom of  
13 Hawaii. So I raise this issue. I have been holding signs  
14 in front of Washington Place in order to replace or  
15 restore Washington Place to the Kingdom of Hawaii.

16 In addition to this, some of these issues, we -- I  
17 have been addressing -- we have been addressing at  
18 Washington Place, just to present this as information.  
19 This jurisdiction is very important. Secondly is the  
20 issue of Aloha. One of the signs that I hold up is this  
21 issue right -- is this sign right here. "Advance aloha,  
22 not militarism in Hawaii."

23 Now, why is this an issue? Well, this has been  
24 addressed briefly by our speakers that have presented and  
25 also actually by Bill Prescott, who actually spoke about

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

## Comments

31

1 the love of God, and the spirit that exists in Hawaii.  
2 Hawaii is a unique and wonderful place. We all can agree  
3 to that. And one of the unique and special aspects of  
4 Hawaii is Aloha. On the licenses, you can see the Aloha  
5 State. Now, this is at issue because there's an  
6 ideological issue -- an ideological conflict that is going  
7 on at the present time between aloha as a value and  
8 militarism. Militarism with aloha is like placing a  
9 brothel in a church. They don't go together.

10 When the soldiers are trained here in Hawaii and  
11 go out and they kill, they get killed. If you're going to  
12 kill someone, then you're going to get killed, too. And  
13 that's what happens with an emphasis on our military  
14 approach. Very effective, but also it has adverse  
15 impacts.

16 I think there are three stages that we must  
17 advance in facing this issue of aloha versus militarism.  
18 First is education. That's what we're doing now. Next is  
19 to speak out against what is going on, the militarism with  
20 the practice -- practicing that's going on in Makua.  
21 Number two, the Stryker forces that are being built up,  
22 and the military that's being sent out here to fight in  
23 foreign countries. Not only does that involve in deaths  
24 of our soldiers, but it -- in retaliation. You can't  
25 escape getting killed if you're going to kill. Neither

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

## Comments

32

1 can you escape retaliation if you're going to kill. Which  
 2 means that Hawaii is being advanced as a military center  
 3 of the Pacific.

4 As such, as it continues to implement war in  
 5 foreign countries, it's subject to retaliation. This type  
 6 of retaliation will be even worse than the attack of Pearl  
 7 Harbor. Do we want that type of impact here in Hawaii?  
 8 We don't.

T4-1

9 Therefore, I call upon our military people, our  
 10 representatives, to stop this buildup, to stop this  
 11 militarization. The outcome will not be a very pleasant  
 12 one -- is not a very pleasant one, even as we look and see  
 13 the impact of our military here in Hawaii. I'm not  
 14 against the military. The military is appropriate under  
 15 suitable conditions. But I am opposed, and I speak out  
 16 against the military and the militarization in Hawaii  
 17 because it's out of place.

18 You know, I had to smile a little, Colonel  
 19 Killian, with your name, Colonel Killian. It's ironic.  
 20 It's appropriate. You represent that aspect of the  
 21 military. And you're very effective. But it's  
 22 inappropriate here in Hawaii, and it must stop.

23 How's the time?

24 FACILITATOR AMARAL: I think you need to  
 25 summarize.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

## Responses

T4-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

## Comments

33

1 MR. AMSTERDAM: Okay. So we're going to start to  
2 summarize now.

3 Therefore, in the purpose of these training  
4 exercises to train our soldiers to go out and to be  
5 effective killers, that's what you do in the military.  
6 It's in conflict with the concept of aloha. And it's  
7 corrupting our islands. And therefore, I call upon the  
8 military to consider this and to stop it.

9 Secondly, in order to deal with this community  
10 engagement, if you're going to be effective in dealing  
11 with this, this involves tourism. Tourism is an important  
12 part of our community and our economy here. The tourist  
13 industry must participate in this. Therefore, the tourist  
14 industry must take an active part to advance aloha and not  
15 militarism.

16 Therefore, this involves discouraging tourism if  
17 you're going to -- if you're going to be serious about  
18 aloha, then you must advance aloha and you must speak out  
19 against the opposite, which is materialists, and advance  
20 aloha through this tourist industry. Therefore, I direct  
21 all our people who are actually opposing this to address  
22 this issue of tourism.

23 Therefore, in conclusion, if we disregard such  
24 factors of jurisdiction and the value of aloha, then we  
25 are going to face adverse impacts. But if we advance

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
(808)524-7778

## Responses

T4-1

**Comments**

34

1 jurisdiction through our government with elections in  
 2 2006, and we also advance aloha and not militarism, then  
 3 the Lord will bless us. We will continue to be a unique  
 4 and special part of the world. And I call upon each of us  
 5 to do this. And I ask the Lord's blessings.

6 In the name of Jesus, amen.

7 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo.

8 Just a reminder, the purpose of the public comment  
 9 is to comment on the Draft Environmental Impact Statement  
 10 that has been circulated. And we hope that you will focus  
 11 your comments on that.

12 The next speaker is Melva Aila, followed by Pat  
 13 Patterson. Mahalo.

14 MS. AILA: Aloha. My name is Melva Aila. I lived  
 15 in Waianae all my life. We need more time to read the  
 16 three volumes of this draft EIS. I have a day job, a home  
 17 job, and a community meeting job that leaves me with no --  
 18 not enough time to read this IES -- I mean, EIS. I'm

T5-1

19 sorry. The Army has failed to give us enough time. The  
 20 maximum of 120 days would be appreciated.

T5-1

21 The four alternatives listed, three out of the  
 22 four include heavy impacts to our land, streams, ground  
 23 water, air, people, and our culture. The three  
 24 alternatives are unacceptable. The Army failed to

T5-2

25 adequately analyze the training somewhere else. It also

T5-3

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T5-1

The Army extended the public review period from 60 days to 75 days. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

T5-2

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act and with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T5-3

The EIS considered other alternatives in Section 2.5. The EIS now includes evaluation of an alternative in which training proposed for MMR would be conducted at the Pohakuloa Training Area, island of Hawaii (See Chapter 2 for a description of this alternative). This alternative was added in response to public comments received on the Draft EIS. Use of MMR, however, remains the preferred alternative.

**Comments**

35

T5-4 | 1 failed to include the people's alternative, which is a  
 2 Center of Excellence in Makua, which include centers of  
 3 ordnance cleanups, restoration, reforestation, traditional  
 4 cultural centers, and education. And many, many more.  
 5 Cleaning up ordnance would be the priority, and no  
 6 additional ordnances should be added to the land.

T5-5 | 7 Archaeology surveys are not complete due to the ICM zones.  
 T5-6 | 8 Contaminants are leaving the MMR through our ground water.  
 T5-7 | 9 Any amount of contaminants is unacceptable. The  
 10 cumulative impacts of contaminants in Makua streams -- I  
 11 mean, shows that the Army has failed in being good  
 12 stewards and good neighbors of the land. Our health is  
 13 important to us, to our keiki, and to our future  
 14 generations.  
 15 If you have some time, please look at the  
 16 community displays towards the back of the room and see  
 17 for yourself our vision of Makua, which is not of  
 18 contamination and desecration, but of healing. Mahalo.  
 19 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo.  
 20 The last two speakers before we take our break,  
 21 not the last for tonight, will be Pat Patterson, followed  
 22 by Dr. Fred Dodge.  
 23 Aloha, Pat.  
 24 MS. PATTERSON: Aloha.  
 25 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Aloha.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T5-4

This and other community alternatives do not satisfy the purpose and need stated in Sections 1.2 and 1.3 of the Draft EIS. Further, the EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T5-5

Surface surveys have been completed for the entire area within the south firebreak road except for those areas containing improved conventional munitions. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the majority of the surface danger zone of the 105mm round. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the Ukanipo Heiau complex, Koiahi Gulch and almost all of Kahanahaiki Valley. This coverage is reflected in Figures 3-24 and 3-25 in the Draft EIS.

Subsurface testing has been undertaken in Sites 4243, 4244, 4245 and 4246. This testing showed there is a subsurface component to these sites; however, this limited testing resulted in protests from two Native Hawaiians due to the invasive and destructive nature of the testing.

An additional subsurface archaeological survey was conducted in November and December of 2006. The results of this survey have been incorporated into Section 3.10, and the survey report is included as Appendix G-9.

T5-6

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. Appendix G contains data and a discussion on contamination to off-site receptors due to Army training.

**Comments**

**Responses**

(Cont.)

T5-7

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. In addition, cumulative impacts are addressed in Chapter 5.

**Comments**

36

1 MS. PATTERSON: I have taken some of Section 2  
 2 that I'd like to respond to. And in Section 2 shows one  
 3 of the differences between those of us who live in this  
 4 community and love Makua Valley and those who come and go  
 5 again in two or three years, not always by their request  
 6 but as the Army works.

7 The EPA representative, who came from  
 8 San Francisco to look at the OBOD, open burn site, heard  
 9 us loudly say it isn't muliwai ponds. Muliwai is a  
 10 Hawaiian word, translated, pond or ponds. Therefore,  
 11 every time you say or write muliwai ponds, you're  
 12 redundant. And, worse, you're continuing to be culturally  
 13 insensitive. So every time you give an orientation or an  
 14 indoctrination, please say muliwai or brackish ponds.

T6-1

15 Now, I did see that you've done a lot in muliwai.  
 16 But I still say, are these muliwai so safe that you'd let  
 17 your own children play in the water? And I ask, are the  
 18 birds returning to the muliwai?

T6-2

T6-3

19 Now, after 80 years of runoff, only 3 feet of  
 20 potential harmful substances in the floor of the three  
 21 muliwai. But I do say, at least it's better than the  
 22 environmental assessment when it only went down 7 inches  
 23 around the edge of the ponds. So there is some  
 24 improvement in this Environmental Impact Statement, and I  
 25 thank you for that. I think you found a lot in those

T6-4

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T6-1  
 The EIS has been revised to reflect the translation.

T6-2  
 Sampling and testing were conducted at MMR to evaluate the poten-  
 tial impacts to off-site receptors. The representative sampling  
 scheme was performed and data analysis showed no potential for  
 contamination to impact off-site receptors from military training.

T6-3  
 The field analysis of the muliwai focused on sampling the sediment  
 and did not evaluate biological resources (see Appendix G-3). In-  
 formation about the relative change in bird activity at the muliwai is  
 insufficient.

T6-4  
 It is not clear what the comment is referring to.

**Comments**

37

1 22 sites in that north muliwai.  
 2 But these continuing live-fire training sessions  
 3 conflict with our existing, our historical, and our  
 4 planned land uses. I am really excited to see the vision  
 5 that Malama Makua has shared. And I do urge people to go  
 6 and look at the university of Makua.

T6-5

7 And I'd like to say that we do need more time.  
 8 And maybe 120 days is the right time, but I don't feel  
 9 like I've had a chance to look at more than a few of the  
 10 sections of the EIS. And as an alternative, I want to  
 11 remind you that in July of 2001, Major General Craig

T6-6

12 Wheldon was quoted in the Honolulu Advertiser saying that  
 13 our dollars that are coming with the Army transformation  
 14 that could go toward transforming ranges on Schofield to  
 15 replace Makua. And I urge you to do that.

T6-7

16 And I think Tetra Tech did a great job on some of  
 17 this. And I had the privilege of walking the muliwai with  
 18 Gary Floyd. And I noticed ads in the newspaper, when I  
 19 was looking for a job, that Tetra Tech has job openings.  
 20 And I'm wondering if we were out all their employees with  
 21 this huge missile that we have, or has the income from  
 22 this monster permit expansion of Tetra Tech.

23 Congratulations if it does. Do you need a secretary or a  
 24 proofreader that could catch things like the L that's  
 25 missing on page 2-1, Paragraph 7, the end of line 1, to

T6-8

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED  
 (808)524-7778

**Responses**

T6-5

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T6-6

The Army extended the public review period from 60 days to 75 days. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

T6-7

The Draft EIS considered Schofield Barracks and other training locations in Section 2.5; additional discussion has been added to this section. Based on the analysis in the section, the Army determined that only MMR satisfies the purpose and need for the proposed action.

T6-8

This typographical error could not be located in the Draft EIS.