

Comments

45

Responses

1 says, A14, surface water protection and waste quality
2 standards. And
3 I quote from -- directly from the EIS, "all waters are
4 subject to an anti-degradation policy which states,
5 water quality are higher than established water quality
6 standards shall not be lowered in quality unless it has
7 been affirmatively demonstrated to be -- to the director
8 of the Department of Health that change is justifiable
9 as a result of important economic or social development
10 and will not interfere with or become inferior to any
11 assigned uses."

12 And then when you read the water resources part,
13 it says that there will be significant affects --
14 significant adverse affects to the water.

15 It says here disbursed pollutants may affect
16 surface water quality if they are transported from
17 surface oils on the ranges to intermittent stream
18 channels by runoff. Once mobilized, stream water may
19 transport the chemicals downstream where they may be
20 positive in the stream channel on the flood plain in the
21 muliwai or the ocean. That's
22 just Alternative 1.

23 When you go to Alternative 2 and 3, it's worse
24 because more -- more CALFEXs are done and more live fire
25 and other kinds of weapons are done. And examples of

T47-5

Comments

46

Responses

1 what would be there would be explosives such as --
2 residue of explosives such as RDX, TNT, HMX, lead, and
3 other metals.

4 And there is also mention of ammonium nitrate
5 which is used in the demolition practices that is
6 colorless and odorless. And it's just -- to me, it's
7 illegal if you're looking really to be legal with the
8 regulation that's cited in the EIS.

9 I just wanted to also mention that -- actually,
10 I learned a bit from the EIS that the military has been
11 in Makua since 1920. 85 years by any measurement
12 certainly that's long enough. Thank you.

13 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo, Karen. The next
14 three speakers are Richard Kinney, Melva Aila, and
15 Jonathan
16 Denik.

17 MR. KINNEY: Aloha, (Speaking Hawaiian.)
18 Makua, kupuna, opio ohana aloha. (Speaking
19 Hawaiian.)

20 Aloha to the military one more time.

21 To finish out where I left off Thursday at
22 Nanaikapono.

23 After uniting the islands into a nation,
24 Kamehameha I outlawed all weapons or fall throughout the
25 islands. Discussing this with some of my Hawaiian

T47-5

Comments

47

Responses

1 friends, family, they tell me, oh, that was a smart move
2 on his part to make sure his people could never revolt
3 against him.

4 Aole. In uniting his islands, it's a known fact that
5 Kamehameha used the weapons of the new world.

6 In my research after uniting the islands, he
7 realized that his people, his nation and from this land
8 could never come to weapons of mass destruction to equal
9 those of the Western world. So the best thing that he
10 could do for his people, his nation is to leave them as
11 a peace zone as a nation.

12 And this peace zone, philosophy, or whatever you
13 want to call it, transferred to all the rulers that
14 followed him. Because literally every royal ruler of
15 Hawaii after Kamehameha I was literally threatened with
16 war by foreign countries.

17 For instance, France -- I believe it was during
18 the reign of Kamehameha III threatened to bomb Honolulu.
19 As Kamehameha III at that time did not allow the
20 teaching of the Catholic religion to the Native Hawaiian
21 people.

22 And learned in the history of the Hawaiian
23 leaders, they was always able to cool the efforts of war
24 to
25 political diplomatic relationship with foreign

Comments

48

Responses

1 countries.

2 And even when it came to the time of 1893 when the
3 United States again wrongfully invaded the government of
4 Queen Liliuokalani, surrounded Iolani Palace with
5 weapons from the U.S.S. Boston, and she knew that the
6 United States wanted war. That she told the Hawaiians
7 one more time to
8 go home. It's better to make love and to be happy.

9 And I admire her because she realized that she
10 could not send her people into war with the United
11 States knowing that in the end result her people would
12 lose and possibly face massacre just like the Native
13 American Indians did.

14 And I bring this up to the military because
15 Hawaii needs to play that role. I believe it is in the
16 best interest that Hawaii gains her independence because
17 this
18 war on terror that President Bush has started may last
19 throughout the duration of this century. So it is best
20 that Hawaii gain her independence so that everyone
21 traveling from here to the continental United States all
22 have to go through foreign inspection.

23 Also another thing that Kamehameha I did. He
24 cautioned the Hawaiians about the future telling the
25 Hawaiians to hold strong to the culture, never walk away

Comments

49

1 from your culture. Warned them if you ever walk away
2 from your culture, you would become strangers in your
3 own land. Your presence in Makua make us strangers in
4 our own lands.

5 So those lands still belong to us.

6 Queen Liliuokalani before passing away said that
7 someday her children's children shall stand and rise.
8 And then you the military -- yes, our culture is once
9 more coming alive. It will be perpetuated by the young
10 people, and we will win the decision to remove you from
11 Makua. And if we have to, we will win the decision to
12 force you to leave Hawaii in peace and once more we can
13 become a peace zone within the Pacific area. Mahalo and
14 aloha.

15 FACILITATOR GOMES: Melva Aila followed by
16 Jonathan Denik and Walter Hunter.

17 MS. AILA: Aloha. My name is Melva Aila.

18 I agree with David Henkin. Could you please
19 answer all of his questions that he asked.

T48-1 20 Once again, I'm going to have to say we need
21 more time to read the draft EIS. 120 days would be
T48-2 22 acceptable. The EIS is incomplete, inadequate, and
23 failed the community's report card. The four
T48-3 24 alternatives given -- three out of the four are
25 unacceptable. There is no alternative about training

Responses

T48-1

The Army extended the public review period from 60 days to 75 days. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

T48-2

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act and with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T48-3

The EIS considered other alternatives in Section 2.5. The EIS now includes evaluation of an alternative in which training proposed for MMR would be conducted at the Pohakuloa Training Area, island of Hawaii (See Chapter 2 for a description of this alternative). This alternative was added in response to public comments received on the Draft EIS. Use of MMR, however, remains the preferred alternative.

Comments

50

1 elsewhere. The Army has failed to adequately analyze
2 the cost of training elsewhere.

3 It also failed to include the community's
4 alternative which is cleaning up, return Makua to the
5 people, and begin the process of healing.

6 The Army has failed to complete the
7 archeological surveys and is unacceptable to mitigate
8 the desecration of our cultural sites and its mana.

9 Contaminants are in the Makua Military
10 Reservation through the ground and surface water. Any
11 amounts of contaminants in our ocean is unacceptable.

12 The cumulative impacts of contaminants in Makua shows
13 that the Army has failed in being good stewards and good
14 neighbors in Makua.

15 Our health is important to us, to our keiki, and
16 to our future generations. We are not going anywhere
17 but you are. Enough already. As a Hawaiian
18 participant, my
19 culture is well-alive and growing. I practice my
20 culture everyday.

21 We are tired of going through this dog and pony
22 show as Aunty Frenchy has mentioned. Just do the right
23 thing. Clean up Makua, return it to the Hawaiian people
24 and the non-Hawaiians who are willing to malama her.
25 Mahalo.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T48-4

Future disposal of the property is beyond the scope of this EIS. Any action beyond those addressed in this EIS would be assessed in a separate NEPA document (see Section 2.3 of the Draft EIS).

T48-5

Surface surveys have been completed for the entire area within the south firebreak road except for those areas containing improved conventional munitions. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the majority of the surface danger zone of the 105mm round. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the Ukanipo Heiau complex, Koiahi Gulch and almost all of Kahanahaiki Valley. This coverage is reflected in Figures 3-24 and 3-25 in the Draft EIS.

Subsurface testing has been undertaken in Sites 4243, 4244, 4245 and 4246. This testing showed there is a subsurface component to these sites; however, this limited testing resulted in protests from two Native Hawaiians due to the invasive and destructive nature of the testing.

An additional subsurface archaeological survey was conducted in November and December of 2006. The results of this survey have been incorporated into Section 3.10, and the survey report is included as Appendix G-9.

The Army has completed all surface and subsurface archaeological surveys consistent with NEPA and the settlement agreements with Malama Makua.

T48-6

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. Further, the hydrogeologic assessment, as reflected in Appendix G-1. Sampling was conducted of soil, sediment, surface water, and groundwater with no pattern of contamination that would impact off-site receptors. Cumulative impacts are addressed in Chapter 5.

Comments

51

1 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo, Melva.
 2 The next person is Jonathan Denik and it's Gail
 3 Hunter and then Walter Hunter.
 4 MR. DENIK: Aloha. Thank you for the
 5 opportunity.
 6 I live with my family in the shadow of Kekui Point in
 7 Makaha along the highway that leads to Makua -- the last
 8 neighborhood actually.
 9 We've become accustomed to receiving large
 10 documents that are difficult to navigate, but
 11 nonetheless have value. But some questions still remain.
 12 First point, that I would just like to make on
 13 the record is according to this document, the
 14 alternatives that you propose other than not doing
 15 anything and leaving --
 16 all three of them have unmitigable impacts, and you
 17 would expect that given the nature of the activity.
 18 The fact that you -- in a previous meeting in
 19 this room a month or so ago have isolated the most
 20 impacts
 21 naming an alternative as the one you would propose for
 22 our community is a bit disappointing.
 23 Secondly, the natural environment is complex and
 24 characterized. We all know that. It's clear. It's
 25 very difficult to decide how to sample -- air moves,

T49-1

Responses

T49-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

Comments

52

1 water
 2 moves, soil is not only on the surface it's below
 3 ground.
 4 It interacts to compounds. So not to belabor the point,
 5 102 soil samples for a 4,000 acre area -- I'm not sure
 6 whether that is acceptable from our point of view. For
 7 you, it might have been an economic choice because it's
 8 expensive. But does that answer our needs?

9 Your analysis shows, for the most part, that
 10 contaminants are below dangerous levels. However, you
 11 do show that contaminants of very dangerous natures are
 12 leaving the area both in water and through the soil
 13 downward.

14 Well, the next question then from our point of
 15 view, we go take our young children to Makua. What
 16 happens to those dioxans and RDX that were found in
 17 surface waters leaving the base and they entered the
 18 natural environment?

19 Well, you may only say it only happen one time,
 20 Jonathan. Well, you only sampled twice. Twice. Two
 21 events. We live here. Rain is scarce in Makua. We
 22 know that. But when it comes, it comes fiercely. You
 23 only sampled only two of those events. So that's
 24 another
 25 concern from our point of view. There is impact there.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T49-2

Sampling was conducted pursuant to the Final Sampling and Analysis Plan, which was developed with input from the community. The soil samples collected at MMR were located in the areas of maximum concentrations of training activities. Background samples provided additional information to expand the spatial coverage. The sampling and analysis plan distributed to the public in 2002, as well as Appendix G-1 of the Draft EIS discuss soil study methodology and data.

T49-3

The hydrogeologic assessment represents a widespread evaluation of the potential for contamination as reflected in Appendix G-1. Sampling was conducted of soil, sediment, surface water, and groundwater with no pattern of contamination that would impact off-site receptors. Sediments collected from the different muliwai were analyzed for various compounds including metals and explosives. Analytical results did not identify any chemicals of potential ecological concerns since the levels found are low (either non-detected, or barely above detection limits), and infrequent (i.e. only 1 sample out of 54 showed RDX at 0.23 milligrams per kilogram). A detailed discussion of the analytical data collected for the muliwai is included in Appendix G-3 of the Draft EIS.

Comments

53

1 The third point with the soil is, you know, I
2 look at this map, and you concentrate soil samples in a
3 very small area based upon this 4,000 acre area. Well,
4 I guess your approach was, well, these are the areas
5 where we think the impact is going to be most important.

T49-2 | 6 Okay. Fair enough. That's a bias sampling. Well,
7 you're biasing towards the conservator. Well, perhaps.

T49-4 | 8 We asked two years ago, what are the cumulative
9 impacts of training in Makua? Training occurred --
10 activities by the military occurred throughout this

T49-5 | 11 valley. Now, within the area that you chose to sample,
12 what kind of sampling protocol did you use? You don't
13 explain it. You have no idea why you chose this deer,
14 coyote. How many samples? I guess I have to look at
15 the CD. We work. We have -- was that a random sampling
16 in that area? Was it random? How was it random? I
17 mean, these are concerns we have on how to approach the
18 problem.

19 As somebody who deals with sampling soils even
20 with farms -- a one (inaudible) farm. If we want to
21 tell a
22 group of farmers a recommendation, we have to take a lot
23 of soil samples regularly not a one shot deal at this
24 low density.

25 So my request would be -- I know it costs money,

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T49-4

The cumulative impacts of military training at MMR are addressed in Chapter 5. In addition, sampling was conducted of soil, sediment, surface water, and groundwater with no pattern of contamination that would impact off-site receptors. See Appendix G-1.

T49-5

The sampling protocols for the field investigations were circulated for 60 days of public review before being finalized and implemented. Summaries of the protocol and methodology are contained in the investigation reports provided in Appendix G of the Draft EIS.

Comments

54

Responses

1 but people are involved and the communities are
2 involved. I think some more work needs to be done
3 especially looking at the coastal area because things
4 are leaving.

5 I think that's it. Thank you.

6 FACILITATOR GOMES: Gail Hunter followed by
7 Walter Hunter and then Sparky Rodrigues.

8 MR. HUNTER: By way of apology and explanation,
9 I'm not obviously Gail. I'm Walt. My leg is killing me
10 so this will be brief.

11 UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Would you move the
12 microphone a little closer to your mouth. Thank you.

13 MR. HUNTER: I've never been accused of being
14 soft spoken before.

15 Okay. So couple of issues.

16 One -- and if people will forgive me, kala mai
17 -- one of the issues people always bring up directed to
18 the military just so they don't think I'm -- they know
19 where
20 I'm coming from.

21 My great grandfather was buried in a colonel's
22 uniform -- unfortunately wrong side -- was the Civil
23 War.

24 My grandfather was a chaplain in the World War II. My
25 father served in Korea, Vietnam, eventually retired from

Comments

55

Responses

1 service with over 32 years of service. I myself
2 originally took the oath to protect this country and its
3 Constitution against all enemies foreign and domestic in
4 1982. I'm guessing that puts us about same time -- I
5 may be a little ahead of you.

6 So from that, as kind of clear -- there is a lot
7 of knowledge, a lot of history within this community.
8 Jonathan, the gentleman who spoke before me, I give him
9 a rough time all the time. Call him a doctor of dirt.
10 He actually has a Ph.D. in soil sampling. So if you
11 would actually would like to know how to conduct a
12 scientific survey that it would be publishable within a
13 soil sampling community -- and I have no idea what their
14 professional magazine is. We won't go there.

15 In -- okay. American Medical Association of
16 Journal -- Fred Dodge as well as Kit Glover, and we have
17 a nurse practitioner, and we have at least two or three
18 lawyers. I think they have been sitting here. Not just
19 a bunch of stupid folks.

20 Back to four brief little areas of comment.
21 David Henkin asked me years ago what I thought of this
22 whole
23 thing in regards to the Makua issue, and I said it's --
24 it's nothing but a distraction. The Army will spend
25 \$6 million or more having you look at their use or

Comments

56

1 non-use of 400 acre chunk of land that they imperatively
2 need for training. Why'd they go ahead and pursue
3 acquisition of other lands elsewhere?

4 If you need the definitive list of what's been
5 accrued during that point in time as we've been arguing
6 over the use -- the actual use is less than 400 acres --
7 380 something if I'm not mistaken.

8 You have purchased or acquired a long-term
9 leases on about 40,000 acres that no one else has
10 noticed. This doesn't include the issues on Mokuleia
11 side, and the jeep trails, and the upgrade from the
12 road, and whole other things. So as you argue that this
13 400 acres is so incredibly important, you've amassed
14 several whole greater of that in other -- even looking
15 at Kawaihae expansion, new road projects going into
16 Pohakuloa area.

17 Which brings up the CALFEX issue. I was a medic
18 with the engineers, and we were working on the fire
19 break
20 in '86. And I think my last CALFEX I was involved in
21 was probably in the year 2000. Thank you very much. So
22 over that time frame, I've never had a CALFEX at the
23 Makua ever. Period. End of story. They were always
24 done at Pohakuloa Range or they were always done firing
25 out of -- I believe

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T50-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

T50-1

Comments

57

1 it used to be Fire Point 110 across the housing area
2 into Camp 5 and Camp 6.

3 As a matter of fact, when we shot off javelins
4 and invited certain distinguished members of the Senate
5 to come watch, that's where we fired because it was
6 better to look at.

7 The next issue for me is your point of view.
8 Nanakuli was proposed to be a dump. One of the biggest
9 problems with Nanakuli being a dump is our asphalt is
10 laid upon a substance of -- Jonathan could probably back
11 me
12 up -- sand.

13 If you have a road that was built on sand -- and
14 it cannot bear commercial traffic or it will probably be
15 overbared -- what you have envisioned -- and I've been
16 here for 15 years, and they're still trying to fix the
17 road in front my house. I wish you the best of luck.

18 Lastly, one of the distinguished gentlemen
19 earlier said there is no Hawaiian religion. If I
20 remember correctly, the Soviet Union said there is no
21 Christianity and it was banned. The same position and
22 conduct of the same thing if you went to Africa you
23 couldn't resist.

24 Episcopal church -- it was a religious English
25 ideas so that people could do whatever they want. And I

Responses

T50-2

The vehicles proposed for use along Farrington Highway are similar to those used in the past, and it is not expected that significant damage from their use would occur. Impacts from overweight/oversize vehicles are addressed in Section 4.6.3.

T50-2

Comments

58

1 have purposely not brought the Jewish people into this
2 since
3 it's in the news lately.

4 I think there is a couple issues. One, to say a
5 religion or people doesn't exist doesn't mean it
6 doesn't.

7 Number two, I've never had a CALFEX in Makua.
8 And all the ones I've always been to was also been
9 someplace else.

T50-1

10 Three, if you need this 400 acres, do you want
11 to give the other 40,000 back? Thanks.

12 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo. I believe that was
13 not Gail. That was Walter and now Gail Hunter followed
14 by Sparky Rodrigues.

15 MS. HUNTER: Thank you. I always write down my
16 testimony and then I always get up and totally ignorant
17 what I wrote down, and I'm probably going to do that
18 again. So bear with me.

19 I'm a resident of Makaha. I'm a mother, a wife,
20 a registered nurse, a cancer survivor, and a veteran.

T51-1

21 After reading the EIS, I'm disgusted and I'm
22 ashamed. I expected an accurate scientific and
23 culturally sensitive piece of material. And you killed
24 a lot of trees to make all these copies of this piece of
25 junk in my opinion.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T51-1

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act and with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate. The hydrogeologic assessment represents a widespread evaluation of the potential for contamination as reflected in Appendix G-1. Sampling was conducted of soil, sediment, surface water, and groundwater with no pattern of contamination that would impact off-site receptors.

Comments

59

T51-1 | 1 As a cancer survivor and as a nurse, I'm very
 2 concerned about the carcinogens in the soil in Makua. I
 3 also spend a portion of every single day of my life at
 4 Makua, seven days a week planting and cleaning. So I
 5 have reason to be concerned. My goddaughter Mahealani,
 6 my son Niko (oldest), my oldest son Chris, my husband
 7 Walt, we all spend time there -- my friends.

T51-2 | 8 This EIS did not look at whether or not the
 9 carcinogens were transferred into limu, into the fish
 10 which I consume everyday and many of the people in this
 11 room consume on a daily basis.

T51-3 | 12 You failed to look at these things which are so
 13 basic to us. You failed to consult the kupuna of this
 14 community before you started this. And that is a
 15 failure
 16 of immeasurable depth. There are no words for me to
 17 tell you how deep that you failed in that one area so I
 18 will not try.

T51-4 | 19 Your fire plan is not a fire plan. It is the
 20 same thing that you've been writing for -- every since I
 21 can remember that I've been involved with this. I don't
 22 know how many years -- over ten years. I've watched the
 23 valley burn 206 times myself personally.

T51-5 | 24 So I'm a little irritated that you don't take it
 25 more seriously. You failed to look at alternative

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T51-2

Under this EIS, the Army conducted the Hydrogeologic Investigation at Makua (report is Appendix G-1 of the Draft EIS), and the Muliwai Sediment Study in the Makua Beach area (report is Appendix G-3 of the Draft EIS.). The analytical results did not show sufficient intensity of measured concentration nor enough frequency of detection to suspect any potential for adverse ecological effects that might enter the human food chain through ingestion of fish or limu. This assessment confirms the EPA's findings and conclusion in 1999 when the muliwai were sampled and tested for metals: "further investigation does not appear warranted at this time because the overall concentrations of the metals are relatively low, and do not tend to indicate a significant adverse impact on ecoreceptors" (USEPA 1999a).

An additional marine resources survey was conducted in August 2006, and the investigation report is included in Appendix G-8.

T51-3

The Army has always included the community, including OHA, in its Section 106 consultations. The Army will continue to consult with any Native Hawaiians having lineal and/or cultural ties to Makua who wish to work with us in the identification, determination of significance and evaluation of sites at Makua.

T51-4

The Integrated Wildland Fire Management Plan was finalized in October 2003. As stated in the Draft EIS, mitigation measures include updating the plan and adding fire suppression infrastructure to address the fire threat from new sources.

Comments

60

T51-5 | 1 training sites in a time when businesses and
 2 organizations are scaling back and doing more than less.

T51-6 | 3 You continue to grab land. And I'm insulted at
 4 that. I'm a person who is deeply connected to this
 5 land.
 6 I am disgusted. I'm -- quite frankly, I'm just pissed
 7 off.

8 This land has to feed us. And you abuse her
 9 everyday. And you train people on her with no concern
 10 for what our relationship is with her. So once again, I
 11 didn't follow my -- what I had written down.

12 I hope you can hear that there is -- there is
 13 much expertise in this community. There is much aloha
 14 in this community, but I feel safe in saying that people
 15 are at the end of the rope. I don't like having guns
 T51-7 | 16 transported down the only highway -- I have two minutes
 17 -- the only highway that serves our whole community. I
 18 don't like to be
 19 driving with my goddaughter and my son in my car behind
 20 a convoy on our only -- our only roadway in and out of
 21 our community.

22 And they kept telling me there has never been an
 23 accident. There's never been an accident. Well, you
 24 know what, you're just lucky. It's only a matter of
 25 time. That wasn't looked at. How come? You know what,

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T51-5

The EIS considered other alternatives in Section 2.5. The EIS now includes evaluation of an alternative in which training proposed for MMR would be conducted at the Pohakuloa Training Area, island of Hawaii (See Chapter 2 for a description of this alternative). This alternative was added in response to public comments received on the Draft EIS. Use of MMR, however, remains the preferred alternative.

T51-6

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

T51-7

The Army's methods for transport of ammunitions are described in Section 3.6.

Comments

61

Responses

1 so maybe we'll fly it over. Like flying it over is more
2 better than driving right through our town.

3 I think that you have a long, long way to go.
4 And I hope you get there, but I vow to you, you will not
5 change Makua.

6 FACILITATOR GOMES: Mahalo. At this time, we're
7 going to take a break. We need the tape changed over
8 there. And when we return, it's Sparky Rodrigues and
9 Andre Perez followed by Bill Aila.

10 (Recess taken from 4:14 until 4:20 p.m.)

11 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Okay. We're back. The
12 next speaker is Sparky Rodrigues followed by Andra --
13 sorry, Andre Perez, followed by William Aila.

14 Sparky?

15 MR. RODRIGUES: Aloha. There's going to be a
16 slide presentation in the back also. And it's visuals
17 by Jahn Beckett and it's black and whites of sites in
18 Makua and activities that's happened in the past several
19 years. Jahn's not here so it will be in the background.
20 It's not necessarily going to coincide with what I'm
21 saying, so it's just a visual to bring the valley to
22 where we're at.

23 To start, one of the things that I've gone
24 through is a lot of pain through the scoping process,
25 through the training and the realization, just recently,

Comments

62

1 that those words of "no significant impact" has a
 2 tremendous amount of impact on me and my family and
 3 community and my naiveness and unawareness of the hopes
 4 growing up and being taught about the constitution and
 5 freedom and those things within the U.S. And thinking
 6 that our leadership would be honest and truthful.

7 And one of the words that was used and we were
 8 talking about it earlier was hewa. And the definition
 9 that came up was malicious manipulation of truths as
 10 being one of the definitions. And this EIS one of the
 11 things that I've decided to call it was voodoo science,
 12 where the air samplings, three samples taken during
 13 training, one sample after training, but the training
 14 scenarios, although it says CALFEX was a reduced level
 15 of training, three separate times of the year.

16 But when I've been there the wind blows in every
 17 direction and the times that I've been able to be
 18 exposed to the ash and the fumes make me sick. You
 19 could feel it on your skin and in your lungs and in your
 20 eyes. Not portrayed there in the test. And even more
 21 so it indicates that there's no significant impact.
 22 We're downwinders from Schofield. We're up the food
 23 chain from the things we gather on the coast. For us
 24 it's a significant impact.

25 There's an article here that I pulled off the

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T52-1

Air sampling was conducted on three days, but each sampling day included multiple sample locations and 10 different types of air samples from each sampling location. There were three sampling stations during the controlled burn event and nine sampling stations during each of the two monitored CALFEX events. See Appendix G-6.

T52-2

The air sampling stations operating during the October 30, 2002 controlled burn were directly impacted by episodes of dense smoke. At one point, the range control staff ordered all personnel at the Admin Trailer area to move indoors to minimize exposure to dense smoke. The southernmost Makua Beach sampling station, in particular, sampled those smoke plumes.

T52-1

T52-2

Comments

63

T52-2

1 web, "Army to Detonate Hazard World War II Shell Located
2 at Schofield." We're downwinders. So what was the
3 notification plan? When were we going to find out?
4 What was the evacuation plan? This was back in April.
5 I found out about this from a friend who lives in
6 Tennessee asking if I knew about it. I don't think the
7 community was notified.

8 Another omission, getting back to the honesty
9 and trust, we're being asked to participate in a process
10 that from the very beginning was to be honest and
11 dealing with truth. And I haven't met anybody that I
12 don't like, but what's happening is that there is an
13 issue of mission. And the mission for the Army is to
14 train. At any expense. Even at ours.

15 After 75 years of life and investment of our
16 community, all the money that has been spent on this EIS
17 and on training, not a penny has come to the community.
18 Half the kids still enter 9th grade but don't graduate.
19 We're over represented in the penal system, even the
20 juvenile justice systems.

T52-3

21 The impacts of the chemicals that we're exposed
22 to from your presence hasn't been studied. That's not
23 in here, the health studies. And I understand, and
24 correct me if I'm wrong, that Tetra Tech, 8,000 strong,
25 Army with the billions of dollars and the smartest minds

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T52-3

The hydrogeologic assessment represents a widespread evaluation of the potential for contamination as reflected in Appendix G-1. Sampling was conducted of soil, sediment, surface water, and groundwater with no pattern of contamination that would impact off-site receptors. Sediments collected from the different muliwai were analyzed for various compounds including metals and explosives. Analytical results did not identify any chemicals of potential ecological concerns since the levels found are low (either non-detected, or barely above detection limits), and infrequent (i.e. only 1 sample out of 54 showed RDX at 0.23 milligrams per kilogram).

Comments

64

1 all focused on Makua, all focused on Waianae, for one
 2 thing: To have your way. To go through the EIS process
 3 and at the very end I'm assuming that at the end it will
 4 be a FONSI, finding of no significant impact, you'll go
 5 ahead and do and select the training level you choose,
 6 and we will continue to support, even with our
 7 resistance, even with our words of we don't want to be
 8 here.

9 And I am reminded, and today I ended up bringing
 10 this right here, which is also not included in your EIS,
 11 the Ku Hui Aloha Aina anti-annexation petitions from
 12 1897 to 1898. My great-grandmother's signature is in
 13 here. But before this came out, before it was
 14 discovered I was angry at my kupuna because they didn't
 15 do anything. They didn't participate. To let you know,
 16 we've been here participating. We've been giving our
 17 testimony. We've been showing up. A lot of pain. We
 18 will continue to show up. When you rotate there's going
 19 to be a replacement. The birds, the stars, don't
 20 change, just the faces and the person that's in the
 21 uniform. You guys get to go home. We get to live here.
 22 The cumulative impacts of all the social and economic
 23 influences that you've exerted on our community is not
 24 included in here.

25 And I also don't see a solution. There's no

Responses

T52-4

Cumulative socioeconomic impacts are addressed in Section 5.3.12.

T52-4

Comments

65

T52-5 1 plan for cleanup. You've done environmental
 2 outplantings of the endangered species. On my Malama
 3 Makua shirt there's an a'a that is now extinct in the
 4 wild. You've done outplanting but I don't see a fire
 T52-6 5 plan to protect these outplanting areas. So the
 6 endangered species that you've attempted to protect
 7 you've moved into another area. They could be in harm's
 8 way. Not addressed.

9 So is this process honest? Are we dealing with
 10 honest and trustworthy people or is this another
 T52-7 11 malicious manipulation of the truth? One of the things
 12 that's really obvious is that there's no regard to our
 13 life because we are not necessarily supportive of what
 14 you want.

15 Secondhand smoke has been identified as a
 16 hazardous -- hazard to people in a household in the
 17 community. But we're downwind of all the fires that has
 18 ever happened in Schofield. Anybody recreating in
 19 Makua, all the fires that happened there.. all the
 20 downwinder impacts that you've exposed us to.

21 And I guess it -- and I'll end with the story
 22 about the scorpion and the turtle, where the scorpion
 23 says trust me, because I need to get across. I need to
 24 use you as a mechanism to get what I need. And the
 25 turtle says no, but you're going to sting me. The

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED (808) 524-7778

Responses

T52-5

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your recommendations and will consider them as it moves forward with the NEPA process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. At this time, because cleanup is not proposed, it is outside the scope of this EIS.

T52-6

The Army Environmental staff have established plans to manage the fuels around plants located in the areas with a high risk of being affected by fires. Implementation of this plan has begun around the Hibiscus brackenridgei and Chamaesyce celastroides plants located adjacent to the firebreak road at the base of Ohikilolo Ridge. The environmental staff's efforts helped keep the 2003 and 2005 fires from burning into these plant populations. In addition, the environmental staff has started controlling the grasses that are located between the plant populations and the firebreak road to reduce the risk of fires spotting into the plant populations. The environmental staff is also collecting plant parts to ensure that the genetic blueprint of the plants most threatened by fire are housed in a safe off-site location, in case the populations are destroyed. This ensures that the plants could be replaced if something happened to them in the future. Finally, as required by the 2001 Biological Opinion, the Army is managing a total of three populations of each plant species with at least two of those populations occurring outside of the high fire risk areas so that all remaining individuals would not be affected by one catastrophic event.

T52-7

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.