

Comments

68

1 I grew up within a military community. My father
 2 was in the military and the ignorance of the depth -- the
 3 depth of the beauty of these people and their care for
 4 each other and the land is -- yeah, like I said, the
 5 military is totally ignorant of it. Like I said the other
 6 night, if you guys weren't -- you would never shoot
 7 another bullet into that land.

8 Yeah, grew up in a military family, and I realize
 9 now with my friends that are local how much the military
 10 -- white people in general live just to consume, exploit,
 11 and pollute. And I'm asking you to stop and leave Makua.
 T34-1 12 Mahalo.

13 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Paulette Kaleikini, followed
 14 by William Aila, followed by Chris Hunter.

15 MS. KALEIKINI: Aloha.

16 (Speaking Hawaiian.) This draft Environmental
 T35-1 17 Impact Statement is unacceptable. Unacceptable period. I
 18 don't even need to have you guys go back and do anything
 19 to it. I'm just going to flat out reject it.

20 Not only is this draft incomplete but it is
 21 insulting. You blatantly ignored the request of our
 T35-2 22 people here that you do a thorough and complete job in
 23 assessing the damage that you have done to the people, the
 24 culture, the heritage.

25 Makua is in a lifeless condition, and it must be

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
 (808)524-7778

Responses

T35-1
 The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environ-
 mental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations.
 Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection
 Agency found the document to be adequate.

T35-2
 Cumulative impacts of historical military training on these re-
 sources were assessed in Chapter 5 in the Draft EIS.

Comments

69

1 left to heal. The military has a bad tract record of
 2 mistreating the aina. Just look what you've done to
 3 Waikane, Waikoloa, Waimea, Puuloa, Pohakuloa, Kahoolawe.

T35-3

4 Continued military use of Makua has caused
 5 extensive damage to the aina, the damage affected our
 6 cultural sites, endangered species, generated pollutants
 7 that contaminate our aina with hazardous chemicals which
 8 threaten the health of na oiwi, the people of the land.
 9 This is genocide. I say it's genocide because I don't see
 10 the stuff happening on the American continent.

T35-4

11 My manao on this draft EIS is that the military
 12 failed to address thoroughly that they have actively
 13 looked for other locations to train your troops. Simply
 14 stating that the terrain of Makua suits the needed
 15 environmental requirement for the training of your troops
 16 is unacceptable. Go back and search again.

17 Try some place else on the American continent.
 18 Try some place like Death Valley. That place is already
 19 lifeless and dead. But you guys don't want to do that.
 20 You want to train your troops here in our islands because
 21 there is the availability to relax in our tropical
 22 islands. Well, you can't have it. So I say that we kue,
 23 this draft EIS and you take it back to where you came
 24 from. Mahalo.

25 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Next speaker is William Aila.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
 (808)524-7778

Responses

T35-3

The Draft EIS evaluated the effects of proposed military training in Chapter 4 and cumulative impacts of military use of MMR in Chapter 5.

T35-4

The EIS considered other training locations in Section 2.5. Based on the analysis in the section, the Army determined that only MMR satisfies the purpose and need for the proposed action.

Comments

70

1 MR. AILA: Aloha. For the record, my name is
 2 William Aila. And for the record, I did that (indicating)
 3 so that Colonel Killian and the gentleman next to him can
 4 see that contrary to testimony provided earlier that
 5 Hawaiian culture did not stop in 1819. In fact, the
 6 Hawaiian culture continues in Makua today. These pictures
 7 were taken in Makua. So it's very important for the
 8 cultural resource specialist to understand that and then
 9 convey that to the folks who rotate every year-and-a-half
 10 to two years in and out that the culture is alive. It is
 11 well. It's growing. It is expanding as we learn more
 12 about ourselves.

T36-1

13 And in saying that, we come to one of the
 14 deficiencies in your draft EIS. That deficiency not
 15 knowing the universal -- the cultural inventory within the
 16 CCAAC, within the surface danger zones because the testing
 17 that's been done to date is inadequate and incomplete. So
 18 you want to -- you want us to testify and offer
 19 suggestions on how to improve your EIS when we aren't
 20 given the complete facts. That's one example.

T36-2

21 Another example is in the EIS, the discussion of
 22 the Commanding General of the Pacific is not stated. It's
 23 not spelled out. So we don't know what the universe of
 24 alternative really is. We know what your universe of
 25 alternatives that you want us to look at is, but without

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
 (808)524-7778

Responses

T36-1

Surface surveys have been completed for the entire area within the south firebreak road except for those areas containing improved conventional munitions. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the majority of the surface danger zone of the 105mm round. Surface surveys have also been undertaken for the Ukanipo Heiau complex, Koiahi Gulch and almost all of Kahanahaiki Valley. This coverage is reflected in Figures 3-24 and 3-25 in the Draft EIS.

Subsurface testing has been undertaken in Sites 4243, 4244, 4245 and 4246. This testing showed there is a subsurface component to these sites; however, this limited testing resulted in protests from two Native Hawaiians due to the invasive and destructive nature of the testing.

An additional subsurface archaeological survey was conducted in November and December of 2006. The results of this survey have been incorporated into Section 3.10, and the survey report is included as Appendix G-9.

The Army has completed all surface and subsurface archaeological surveys consistent with NEPA and the settlement agreements with Malama Makua.

T36-2

The level of training described for the alternatives was not based on the specific training requirements of the Army, but on the need for various military units to train at MMR. In this sense, the types of training and number of training days described under each alternative represent maximums below which actual use of MMR would fall. Because of this approach, the discretion of Army commanders to reduce training requirements for their units would not greatly expand the range of alternatives available to accomplish the Army's purpose and need. The discretion given to the Major Command Commander is still dependent on the assessment of the unit for combat. The Major Command Commander cannot eliminate training requirements that in his judgement are necessary for unit readiness, notwithstanding environmental considerations.

Comments

71

Responses

T36-2

1 presenting to us the scope and the breaths of the
 2 discretion that the General has in terms of designating
 3 what is certified training, you betray the trust in us.
 4 You're telling us only part of the story, and you want us
 5 to only look at part of the story.

6 The NEPA process is supposed to allow us to look
 7 at all of the story. So please stop hiding that part of
 8 the story from us and please go back and tell Tetra Tech
 9 and the Army Corps of Engineers that the universe of
 10 options is really this, and it's not just options 2, 3,
 11 and 4.

T36-3

12 Further, there is no financial analysis of those
 13 options 2, 3, and 4 or any of the options that might be
 14 available had we been informed of the discussion that the
 15 Commanding General of the Pacific possesses. That's the
 16 third one that you hide from us and not share with us.
 17 And Silas, it's the third one in which this document does
 18 not comply with NEPA.

19 For all you folks that are out in the audience
 20 that work for and are putting together this EIS, I want
 21 you to write down -- because I see a lot of you taking
 22 notes -- I want you to write down this phrase, "Can we
 23 live with it?" And that's for you. "Can you live with
 24 it?" The reason I want you to write that down is because
 25 we have to live with it.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
 (808)524-7778

T36-3

The alternatives considered in the EIS, both those evaluated in detail and those eliminated from further analysis, were analyzed based on their ability to achieve the proposed action and meet the purpose and need, not on whether they are cost prohibitive. For this reason, no financial analysis of the alternatives is included in the EIS.

Comments

72

1 So I want you guys to write that down -- all of
2 you guys that are taking notes and are going to get
3 together later on and talk about what was said, and I want
4 you to discuss that. "Can you live with it?" And
5 understand that we have to live with it.

6 When you rotate out two years from now, when you
7 go on to your next environmental job, you have to stand by
8 the integrity of this document. And my words telling you
9 that in three places you have not divulged the truth. You
10 have to live with that.

11 Now that I have informed you that you are not
12 telling the truth that you, Silas, representing the Army
13 are not complying with NEPA, you guys have to live with
14 that not me. We have to live with what's left in Makua.
15 You have to live with what you're doing to this process
16 and in this process what you're doing to us.

17 So can you live with it? I want you to think
18 about that all night tonight. I want you to think about
19 it all day tomorrow, and I even want you to think about it
20 on Saturday when you give the same talks, when we point
21 out the same deficiencies in this document, and in this
22 document in this process because we have to live with it.

23 The other flaw in this document and we've said it
24 from scoping -- we've said it in scoping in the Stryker
25 EIS is, there is no connectivity. So for the Stryker EIS,

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

T36-4

Because the actions proposed for MMR and SBCT are not connected, separate EIS were prepared for those projects. While those projects were designed so either one could be implemented independently of the other, SBCT Forces may use MMR if the ranges are available after completion of the MMR EIS and ROD. Accordingly, the MMR EIS contains an analysis of the potential environmental impacts associated with dismantled CALFEXs for current force and SBCT. See Chapter 5.

T36-4

Comments

73

1 we talk about having to revamp your training and all the
 2 other training sites throughout the state, but you don't
 3 talk about Makua. Silas, that's a violation of NEPA with
 4 the Stryker.

5 Now, we talk about Makua but we don't talk about
 6 all the other training in the Stryker. It's like you guys
 7 don't want to mix the two. It's like they're kissing
 8 cousins or something like that. You don't want to mix the
 9 two. The fact that you don't address each other -- the
 10 actions of each other is a violation of NEPA.

11 And Silas, if you don't get your act together,
 12 David is going to see you guys in court again. We are
 13 going to be before Molloway, and I'd hate to hear her say
 14 those words again that this was a deficient EA as she said
 15 about the first one and this is a deficient EIS about this
 16 one.

17 So please take those words into consideration. I
 18 know I've been taught by communications people that you
 19 have to say it three times. So you're going to hear it
 20 from me again on Saturday. I might change up the words a
 21 little bit so you don't get bored, but can you live with
 22 it because we have to. Thank you.

23 FACILITATOR AMARAL: The next speaker is Chris
 24 Hunter.

25 MR. HUNTER: Aloha. My name is Chris Hunter.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
 (808)524-7778

Responses

T36-5

Please see the response to Comment T36-4. The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T36-5

Comments

74

1 Much like Aunt Dorrie, I was raised in a military family.
2 The difference was -- is early on, I started to realize a
3 lot of things the military did was wrong.

4 Just the theoretical question how were we supposed
5 to trust you or trust anything that you write when your
6 own command says don't worry about the water on Schofield
7 and two months later it's a super pond site?

8 Just a quick background on some other areas you
9 have practiced in. Some people might recognize some of
10 these. There was a place called Alma Guardo (phonetic.)
11 I think it was in Nevada -- New Mexico -- excuse me.
12 There was the Aberdeen Proving Grounds -- oh, wait,
13 neither of those is inhabitable anymore.

14 My father was in the military for 22 years. I
15 remember when we first started going through this -- I
16 think it was three or four years ago when this came about.
17 In sitting there at home shaking his head going, "Why did
18 we need Makua?" He remembers firing from North Range in
19 the East Range over Kolekole Pass. That's a heck of a lot
20 longer from all the way on the beach and all the way in
21 back of Makua Valley.

22 The other thing that still flabbergast me is the
23 fact it's nothing against you. The reality of it is we'll
24 get you guys. You'll start to see and then it will be
25 time for you to rotate out, and then we'll have to start

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

Comments

75

1 the whole process over again.

2 But I see a whole lot of members that were here
3 when we first started. So apparently, we're willing to
4 stay for the long haul because you can rotate out. We
5 don't have that option. This is our home. This is where
6 we live. This is where we raise our families. This is
7 our home.

8 I noticed not a whole lot of emotions as far as
9 all of these things are concerned in practicing in
10 different areas and the cultural values. My dad brought
11 it up a real funny way too. He said, "Would we practice
12 in Arlington or any of the other military sites?" And I
13 don't think so.

14 Again, the same thing as what Uncle William also
15 just said, it was a deficient EA, environment assessment,
16 and it's a deficient EIS. There's big pukas in it.
17 There's big areas missing. Mahalo.

18 FACILITATOR AMARAL: I've come to the end of those
19 people that have signed up to speak. Is there anyone else
20 wishing to speak into the record? If so -- Vince, please.

21 If you do want to speak, I wonder if you can make
22 your way here and then, you know, we'll deal with you that
23 way. Just line up.

24 Vince, can you say your name.

25 MR. DODGE: Aloha. I'm Vince Dodge. I have a

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

T37-1

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act and with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

T37-1

T38-1

Comments

76

T38-1 1 request from friends on the Windward side who asked that
2 perhaps a meeting of some kind can be organized for them
3 to come out and testify on the EIS. So I'd like for that
4 definitely to go into the record.

5 There are people all over the islands that this is
6 a major concern, and of course, it's because of the
7 control that the military has throughout our islands.

8 I said on Tuesday that the EIS is deficient. It's
9 failed in many respects, and I just want to repeat some of
10 that again.

11 There's been no access to the back of the valley
12 due to the fact that it's supposed that ICMs and --
13 improved conventional munitions which are antipersonnel
14 bunkers that were seen in that area some years ago.

T38-2 15 The military -- the Army had agreed to make a good
16 faith effort to get the necessary waivers so that folks
17 could go back and study the back part of the valley as
18 well as we would have cultural access.

19 And as Dave Henkin so clearly pointed out in his
20 testimony, those requests never left the island. And in
21 fact, they are still sitting somewhere. That's not a good
22 faith effort. That's a failure. So you have an EIS that
23 it's missing a large chunk of Makua Valley in its study.

24 I also want to address the different options. You
25 know, there is no action and then there is three different

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

T38-1

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process. All members of public were invited to participate in the three public meetings held for the Draft EIS through advertisements in local newspapers, press releases, and direct mailing of notices. In addition to oral comments, written comments were also accepted through mail, email, and facsimile.

T38-2

The Army's waiver request (dated May 5, 2006) was rejected by Army Headquarters on December 21, 2006, as stated in a Deputy Assistant Secretary of the Army memorandum, dated January 10, 2007.

Comments

77

T38-3

1 scenarios for training. I believe that in the scoping
 2 process, we asked that -- the other -- another option be
 3 considered and some effort be put into researching the --
 4 what would happen if the Army decided to clean up the
 5 valley and to employ people on the Waianae coast to do
 6 that.

7 And we know that there are a fair amount of people
 8 on this coast that would turn out to do that kind of
 9 restoration and reclamation work. We know that kind of
 10 work will take probably decades to do. So there would be
 11 long-lasting employment in our community.

12 And we know that that kind of work is -- has its
 13 dangers and that the compensation is pretty good for that
 14 kind of work. I have the bounty of being on the sweeping
 15 crew for the clean up of some of the UXO, surface
 16 unexploded ordnance, in Makua Valley two summers ago. We
 17 had a crew of about 20 -- mostly young local folks mostly
 18 from Waianae that came aboard and did that work.

19 It's totally possible to clean that valley --
 20 absolutely totally possible. It may never be as safe as,
 21 you know, your local playground. Of course, that depends
 22 where your local playground is. If it's in a place where
 23 the military trained, it's probably not so safe.

24 But that valley can grow food. It's been a bread
 25 basket. It will be a bread basket again. It just needs

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
 (808) 524-7778

Responses

T38-3

The EIS does not contain this information because remediation of MMR is not proposed at this time, a discussion of this issue is beyond the scope of this EIS.

Comments

78

1 -- it needs the vision. It needs the intent. It needs
 2 the time and energy to be spent. We believe that that is
 3 an extremely viable option that needs to be considered,
 4 you know.

T38-4

5 As I sit tonight listening to testimony, it occurs
 6 to me that this is not your EIS. It's our EIS. I mean,
 7 we are all paying for it. It's our tax dollars that are
 8 paying for it. I'd also like to know what the rough cost
 9 for this document is at this point in time. I'm hoping
 10 that Saturday -- I'm asking on Saturday will you please
 11 have that information. And think again this is our tax
 12 dollars at work. We would like to know what this process
 13 has cost us.

14 So it's ours and we have intended from the very
 15 beginning to play a full part in the development of this
 16 Environmental Impact Statement. Because it's really
 17 important to us. It's our valley.

18 So it's -- you know, the more you work with us,
 19 the clearer picture we'll all have of what's going on in
 20 Makua. We need that because we are living here. And
 21 we're going to keep living here. And I think even if you
 22 don't live here, we need that because it's turning out
 23 that this planet is getting smaller and smaller.

24 And what you -- the trash you throw out of your
 25 backyard is landed in somebody else's front yard and vice

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
 (808)524-7778

Responses

T38-4
 Including all the studies agreed to under the 2001 Settlement Agree-
 ment with Malama Makua, the estimated cost of the EIS is approxi-
 mately \$5 million.

Comments

79

T38-5

1 versa. So I strongly urge the Army to take this document
2 back and please continue to work out the deficiencies in
3 it. Mahalo.

4 MR. DETROYE: (Speaking Hawaiian.) Aloha. My
5 name is Butch DeTroye. My kupuna, Uncle Eddie Kahanamau
6 (phonetic) gave me my Hawaiian name Limahana and tells me
7 to introduce myself and say that I live Waianae and nobody
8 going to ask where I'm from. But I am in Waianae via
9 Wisconsin.

10 I was fortunate enough to come to these islands
11 about 33 years ago. I met my wife who is Hawaiian. From
12 her ohana, all of her friends, they taught me Hawaiian.

13 One of the uncles said the other night and tonight
14 he mentioned it again that when the kapu system went out,
15 the other -- tonight he never mentioned it but the other
16 night -- that mana went out with the kapu system. No more
17 mana. That's heavy.

18 Mana has many different meanings which most of us
19 in this room cannot really comprehend. Basically,
20 spiritual power, supernatural power. So I guess when mana
21 went out, and I guess the one no more mana. You know, the
22 one lost its mana. So I guess the sun lost its mana too.

23 So where does that leave us? I felt the mana in
24 the 33 years that I've been here. I've been able to feel
25 the mana. I've been able to experience the mana. I'm

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

T38-5

The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act and with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate.

Comments

80

1 very fortunate to be at Mauka working in the loi, working
2 with kaloa, the spirit of the kau, the ancestor of the
3 Hawaiians. I'm very fortunate to do that.

4 And I want to request a couple of -- I see plenty
5 of nice charts back there, but heavy job. That was really
6 nice stuff explaining everything down to the details, but
7 I don't see the chart where -- how do we measure the loss
8 of mana? Where is that chart, yeah? I like see that
9 chart over there if you can somehow put that -- make that
10 chart for us if we can figure out where that chart is and
11 how much mana has been lost over the years of desecrating
12 that -- that aina.

13 And I would also like, you know, how they get rain
14 gauges where they can catch the water and measure the
15 rainfall amounts over different parts of the islands or
16 anywhere, I like one tear gauge. Yeah, for the tears that
17 -- for the tears of the ancestors -- the kupuna, the
18 aumakua, the akua.

19 Let's have a tear gauge. Let's see how much they
20 are crying. How much they have cried and how much they
21 are still crying. Maybe we can measure that one. We have
22 the technology nowadays to measure everything.

23 So mahalo for letting me speak. Mahalo for
24 listening.

25 Another thing that I want to mention is a sense of

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808) 524-7778

Responses

Comments

81

1 place, yeah. There is no way that you folks can have a
2 sense of place. I was in the military. I'm a veteran. I
3 went and did my duty and learned how to kill during
4 Vietnam. I believed in it very much so at the time. I
5 thought the Communists were coming to America. They were
6 going to come to take us over. Yeah, that was the rap at
7 the time. So I had to go fight them over there.

8 After I got out, I learned why I shouldn't have
9 done that. That's one of the reasons that I came to
10 Hawaii to get away from all that action that was happening
11 in America at that time. And my one dream -- my ultimate
12 dream is to become a citizen of Hawaii one day because
13 justice will come. It's been over 100 years already.
14 It's been overall 200 years more but justice will come.
15 And hopefully you folks can help us bring that justice.
16 So mahalo.

17 FACILITATOR AMARAL: There are two people that
18 wish to speak. So I would ask as you come here to the
19 podium, to give your name so the stenographer can get it.

20 Aloha, Carl.

21 MR. YOUNG: Aloha ahiahi kakou. Imiola Young,
22 '-I-m-i-o-l-a, Imiola Young.

23 I'll be real short. I'm glad the former speaker,
24 Butch Hanalima -- Limahana mentioned he was a Vietnam
25 veteran. I was hoping Brother Rocky Naiole would come

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses