

Comments

Responses

2

1	I N D E X	
2		
3	PRIVATE COMMENTS BY:	Page
4	WALTERBEE ALDEGUER	3
5	LEANDRA WAI	3
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Comments

3

Responses

1 (Private Comments at 9:50 p.m.)

T20-1 2 WALTERBEA ALDEGUER: All I want to say is I just
 3 received a copy of the EIS yesterday. And so I want to
 4 echo everybody else that's saying they need more time. And
 5 120 days would be good. If we can get more, that will be
 6 fine. Because there's no way I can respond at this time.
 7 That's it.

T21-1 8 LEANDRA WAI: I ditto all that she just said. So
 9 rewrite it all over again. I just got mine a week ago, and
 10 I need to prepare testimony.

11 I also want to say I was an observer during all
 12 the CALFEXs and training that was going on. I was a Malama
 13 Makua observer.

T21-2 14 And I feel like the air study is flawed already
 15 because the day that the old OBOD site was burned there
 16 were no air monitors.

17 So that information is lost to us forever. And
 18 that site was never ever burned again during their training
 19 scenarios that they listed for their air quality.

20 I wanted to say it in public, but I know
 21 everybody would be alarmed and say that it was flawed. But
 22 I do want it included in the testimony.

23 WALTERBEA ALDEGUER: I work for Leeward Community
 24 College. And UH Manoa was sent a set. I work for Leeward
 25 Community College at Waianae. And UH Manoa, as I looked on

T20-1
 The Army extended the public review period from 60 days to 75 days. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

T21-1
 The EIS was prepared in accordance with the National Environmental Policy Act with applicable federal and Army regulations. Review of the Draft EIS by the US Environmental Protection Agency found the document to be adequate. In response to comments, an additional 60 days were provided to the community to review the Draft EIS and associated studies related to marine resources and archaeological surveys, from February 2 to April 3, 2007. The technical experts retained on behalf of Malama Makua were provided 76 days for review of the marine resources study, archaeological study, and Draft EIS.

T21-2
 The air sampling plan called for monitoring one controlled burn. The selected burn event included a much larger acreage than the OB/OD area, and included areas much closer to Farrington Highway and Makua Beach than the OB/OD area. Monitoring the burn at the OB/OD area instead of the October 30, 2002 burn would undoubtedly have produced much lower pollutant concentration measurements at the public use areas on Makua Beach, and would not have been representative of other prescribed burn events.

Comments

4

1 that, was sent a set. And I don't think they really are as
2 concerned about what's happening in Makua as the people of
3 Waianae who attend LCC with me.

T20-2

4 As a matter of fact, we do have students in there
5 right now. So it would be nice if they send more copies of
6 revisions or anything else to Leeward Community College,
7 Waianae Campus, 86-088 Farrington Highway, Suite 201,
8 Waianae 96792.

9 (Private comments concluded at 9:55 p.m.)

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808) 524-PRSU

Responses

T20-2

The Army thanks you for your comment and appreciates your participation in this public review process. Your comment has been considered and has been included as part of the administrative record for this process.

Comments

5

Responses

1 CERTIFICATE
2 STATE OF HAWAII)
3) SS.
4 COUNTY OF HONOLULU)
5 I, WILLIAM T. BARTON, RPR, Certified Shorthand
6 Reporter, State of Hawaii, do hereby certify that on August
7 23, 2005 at 9:50 p.m. there appeared before me the persons
8 whose statements are contained herein; that I am neither
9 counsel for any of the parties herein, nor interested in
10 any way in the outcome of these proceedings;
11 That the statements herein were by me taken down in
12 machine shorthand and thereafter reduced to print via
13 computer-aided transcription under my supervision; that the
14 foregoing represents a complete and accurate transcript of
15 the statements of said persons to the best of my ability.
16 Dated this 1st day of September 2005 at Honolulu,
17 Hawaii.
18
19
20 _____
21 WILLIAM T. BARTON, CSR No. 391
22 Notary Public, State of Hawaii
23 My Commission expires August 7, 2005
24
25

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808) 524-PRSU

This page intentionally left blank.

Comments

Responses

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

In Re:)
))
MAKUA MILITARY RESERVATION)
DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT)
STATEMENT PUBLIC COMMENT)
MEETING)
)

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

The above matter came on for public comment meeting on behalf of the 25th Infantry Division (Light) and the U.S. Army Hawaii at Nanaikapono Elementary School, 89-153 Mano Avenue, Nanakuli, Hawaii, commencing at 6:58 p.m., on Thursday, August 25, 2005.

REPORTED BY: ADRIANNE IGE KURASAKI, RPR, CSR 388
 JAMIE MIYATA, CA CSR 12825

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
Suite 1470, Makai Tower
733 Bishop Street
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813
(808)524-7778

Comments

Responses

2

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

U.S. ARMY DRAFT ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT
MEETING STAFF LIST

PANEL:

Colonel Howard Killian, Garrison Commander
Colonel Timothy J. Pendolino, Staff Judge Advocate

FACILITATORS:

ANNELE AMARAL
KUUMEA ALOHA GOMES

HAWAIIAN-ENGLISH TRANSLATOR:

KEHAULANI PUU

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Comments

Responses

3

1	INDEX	
2		PAGE
3	OPENING PULE:	
4	Pat Patterson	4
5	WELCOMING REMARKS:	
6	Annelle Amaral	4
7	Colonel Howard Killian	5
8	PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD:	
9	Pat Patterson	11
10	Kauai Amsterdam	16
11	James Manaku, Sr.	20
12	Bud Ebel	25
13	Richard Kini	29
14	Alice Greenwood	32
15	Adelaide "Frenchy" DeSoto	36
16	Fred Dodge	37
17	Manu Kaiama	40
18	Bill Prescott	46
19	Fred Cachola	50
20	Glenda Mauwae	61
21	Sparky Rodrigues	63
22	Nancy Rappaport	67
23	Doreen Redford	67
24	Paulette Kaleikini	68
25	William Aila	70
26	Chris Hunter	74
27	Vincent Dodge	76
28	Butch Detroye	79
29	Imiola Carl Young	81
30	Kit Glover	83
31	Sparky Rodrigues (continued)	84
32	Imiola Carl Young (continued)	84
33	CLOSING REMARKS:	
34	Annelle Amaral	85
35	Colonel Killian	85

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Comments

Responses

4

1 Thursday, August 25, 2005 6:58 p.m.

2 PROCEEDINGS

3 MS. PATTERSON: Aloha kakou. Shall we pray.

4 Grace of God, ke akua alaa, by whatever name we
5 know you, we thank you for bringing us together again this
6 evening. We thank you for giving us the challenges that
7 we are addressing. We thank you for these people who have
8 come to make things right. We ask you to be with us,
9 each, every step of the way so you will give us the words
10 to bring your will to this place. All these things, we
11 ask, through your spirit. Amen. Mahalo.

12 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo. Thank you very much,
13 Pat, for that.

14 Okay. As we begin, let me introduce myself. To
15 those of you who may not know me, my name is Annelie
16 Amaral. I'm one of the facilitators this evening. My
17 co-facilitator is Kuumea Aloha Gomes. And we will spell
18 one another throughout the night.

19 Another person I would like to -- or two people I
20 need to introduce to you. With the U.S. Army seated at
21 the table here receiving the testimonies, closest to you
22 is Colonel Pendelino of the Staff Judge Advocate's office.
23 And next to him, of course, is Colonel Howard Killian, the
24 Garrison Commander of the 25th Infantry Division.

25 And I'd like to invite Colonel Killian to come up

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Comments

5

Responses

1 and say a few words, if you will.

2 COLONEL KILLIAN: Thank you, Annelle.

3 Aloha kakou.

4 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Aloha.

5 COLONEL KILLIAN: Thank you for taking time out of
6 your busy schedules to be here this evening. This is the
7 second of three scheduled meetings we have this week. The
8 next meeting will be on Saturday back up at the Waianae
9 Park district building that we were in on Tuesday night.
10 And that will be Saturday afternoon.

11 I want to thank you for the courage it takes to
12 get up and stand before a group and in front of a camera.
13 We will make every effort to get down accurately what your
14 testimony is. And for whatever reason, you may not want
15 to do that orally or have a chance to state everything
16 you'd like to, we have many opportunities for you to
17 provide written testimony. And if you think something
18 else, makuaeis.com is up and you can submit your testimony
19 that way as well.

20 I think Tuesday night, we got -- we had 21 folks
21 come up and give testimony, which was a great turnout.
22 And hopefully, we'll have the same level of participation
23 tonight.

24 Please bear with us. This is meant to be an
25 exchange, and unfortunately we can't do a lot in the way

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Comments

6

1 of a response to your testimony this evening. But I would
2 encourage you all that just because we're in a 60-day
3 public comment period does not limit the dialogue that the
4 Army seeks to have with the community. And we will -- I
5 will encourage that across the board, not only within this
6 time period but into the future. So as I said Tuesday
7 night, my staff, myself, remain at your disposal should
8 you request access to Makua, education on Makua, or for
9 that matter anything to do with the Army.

10 So once again, I offer that to the community and
11 anybody who's interested. And this is kind of a
12 culminating process. We started in July. We did three
13 public meetings and three meetings to different groups on
14 the coast in July, to try to get the word out on the
15 EIS -- well, actually, before the EIS was published but we
16 knew it was coming. And so tonight is the second of three
17 meetings, and basically its our turn to sit and listen.
18 And we will give your our full attention.

19 Thank you, Annelle.

20 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Thank you. Okay. Thank you,
21 Colonel.

22 For those of you that wish to speak this evening,
23 we'd ask you to return to the sign-in table and sign in
24 that you wish to speak. They'll then -- the staff there
25 will bring us these cards. We're basically calling the

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

Comments

7

1 testifiers in the order that we're given the cards. And
2 so if you want to speak, you sort of have to sign up;
3 otherwise, I won't know that you need to speak.

4 As the Colonel has said, this is the second of
5 three meetings to invite public comment on the Draft
6 Environmental Impact Statement on the military training
7 activities at Makua Military Reservation. The meetings
8 consist of an open house, during which informational
9 material on the project can be reviewed, questions can be
10 asked. After the open house period, it is then followed
11 by a public comment period, which is a period that is on
12 the record.

13 The next meeting that will take place will be on
14 Saturday, August 27th, at Waianae District Park.
15 12:30 to 1:45 is the open house period. 2:00 to
16 6:00 p.m., the public comment period.

17 Public comment is a very formal process. There
18 is, as you may note, a court reporter in the front of the
19 room who is taking verbatim everything that is said here
20 on the microphone, which is entered into the written
21 record. Also with us, as you can see, is a videographer,
22 who is recording the comments as they are provided.
23 Another stenographer, in fact, is located at the room to
24 the rear and is available for anyone wishing to make
25 public comment but not in front of everyone, but actually

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

Comments

8

1 requesting a more private way of commenting. Sometimes
2 people are fearful standing in the front of a large
3 audience. So there is an alternative way to give oral
4 testimony, and that is by going to the stenographer in the
5 back of the room.

6 So as a result of having the court reporter and
7 the videographer here taking the oral record, we ask that
8 if you have any discussions and conversations that you
9 need to have, that you take it outside of this room so
.0 that the additional noise doesn't interfere with these two
.1 individuals that are making the written record.

.2 We ask also that if you have a pager or a cell
.3 phone, to put it on vibrate or put it on silence, again so
.4 we don't compete with those noises.

.5 This evening, we have a Hawaiian language
.6 translator provided for us. She is Kehaulani Puu from
.7 Leeward Community College. And so I'd like to invite
.8 Kehaulani up to say a few words.

.9 Kehaulani.

:0 TRANSLATOR KEHAULANI: Aloha ahiahi kakou.

:1 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Aloha.

:2 TRANSLATOR KEHAULANI: My name is Kehaulani Puu,
:3 and I am here tonight to serve as a Hawaiian translator
:4 for those of you who wish to testify in part or in whole
:5 maka olelo Hawaii. For some of you, I understand you may

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

Comments

Responses

9

1 not want to have your testimony translated, maybe
2 something special or sacred to you (Speaking Hawaiian),
3 but if you do want to utilize me, my services (Speaking
4 Hawaiian), and if you have any questions, just hele mai.
5 Mahalo.

6 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Mahalo. Nicely done.
7 The public comment period, as you know, is open
8 until September 21st, so further comments can be made
9 beyond Saturday and submitted either via mail, fax,
10 e-mail. Forms are found at the entrance at the sign-in
11 table. If you have any questions about public comment,
12 Mr. Gary Shirakata is at the back of the room. He's
13 wearing a green shirt. And you can go to him and ask him
14 any specific questions that you may have.

15 You should know that regardless of the form that
16 comments come in, equal weight is given to all comments.
17 So it doesn't matter if you stand up here and give it, it
18 doesn't matter if you hand write it or e-mail it, it's all
19 considered equally. And so that's not -- shouldn't be a
20 problem.

21 Okay. When we call you up to speak, I'm going to
22 call your name, and then that way the court reporter kind
23 of knows your name. If I forget to, remind me, or
24 identify yourself if I haven't made clear who you are,
25 because the court reporter needs to know who the speaker

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Comments

10

1 is.

2 The role of the facilitator is really just kind of
3 monitoring for time. Our job is to make sure that we meet
4 the promise we've given you. We've told you we'll begin
5 at 7:00; we're going to leave at 10:00. So we're going to
6 try to keep this meeting timely and we're going to try to
7 get everyone out in a timely fashion.

8 We're also kind of monitoring for appropriate
9 conduct. As we see it, this is an opportunity for people
10 to say what is in their hearts and on their minds, to
11 share and to be heard. So we ask that the speakers all be
12 treated with respect, regardless of your personal opinion
13 on content of their speech, that we treat everyone in the
14 front of the room with respect. We let them say what they
15 need to say. We don't interfere with it. We listen and
16 hear. So our job here also is to just monitor for
17 conduct, make sure that people behave appropriately and
18 treat one another appropriately.

19 As much as we can, we're going to give you as much
20 time as we can for you to speak. Now, if it turns out
21 that there are lots of speakers registered and some of us
22 are a little loquacious and we're running out of time,
23 then we're going to have to start to put a time limit on
24 the duration of your speech. But for now, we'll let you
25 speak, and we hope that you stay on the subject.

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses

Comments

11

1 Remember, this evening's discussion, the purpose
2 of this meeting is to comment on the Draft Environmental
3 Impact Statement. But if the facilitators ask you to
4 summarize or to bring your comment to an end, it's not
5 personal, we don't mean to hurt your feelings, but we hope
6 that you will respond accordingly.

7 We will take breaks on the hour. That gives the
8 court stenographers a chance to switch off. It gives the
9 videographer a chance to change tape. And it gives us all
10 a chance to get some more water or cookies or something.
11 Okie dokie. I think that's it now, and I think we're
12 ready to begin.

13 The first speaker is Pat Patterson, and she is
14 followed by Kauai Amsterdam.

15 Pat.

16 MS. PATTERSON: That's good. Aloha again.

17 FACILITATOR AMARAL: Aloha.

18 MS. PATTERSON: I would like to deal with 3.12
19 socioeconomic and environmental justice. ROI, Region of
20 Influence. Your training in Makua doesn't affect other
21 parts of Oahu as it does the Waianae Coast. But even the
22 name "Waianae" has been affected by the military's
23 presence and the noise in Makua. "Waianae," the place of
24 big mullet. Tales of Makua Bay teeming with mullet came
25 from any oral trans -- history taken, whether by Marian

PACIFIC REPORTING SERVICES UNLIMITED
(808)524-7778

Responses